

From: [Mark Savinski](#)
To: [FWP Madison River COM](#)
Cc: [Commissioner Tabor](#); [Commissioner Waller](#); [commissioner byorth](#); [KC Walsh](#); [commissioner cebull](#); [commissioner robinson](#); [commissioner lane](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Comments on Recent Delay in Implementing the Recommendations of the Madison River Work Group.
Date: Friday, August 5, 2022 3:37:45 PM

I write this email to strongly voice my opposition to the most recent delaying tactic regarding the implementation of the most recent Madison River Work Group's recommendations. The Madison River has been studied, analyzed, and put under a microscope for at least the past 17 years, with numerous study committees and work groups formed, and yet, little or nothing has been done to implement the recommendations of said study and work groups. What is it going to take to get some action; for the entire resource to crash! I do not understand FWP Commissioner Tabor's comments that the FWP Commission is not ready to act on the proposed recommendations. Is the real reason for the delay that MOGA's leadership did not approve of the recommendations presented by the latest Work Group. Who is making decisions here, the appointed FWP Commissioners or special interest groups connected to certain politically influential outfitter groups? Many outdoors persons I have discussed the Madison River situation with have a favorite word to describe the debacle that has gone on with the Madison River. That word is JOKE! I think that word describes the situation in a nutshell. DO SOMETHING NOW; DO NOT JUST CONTINUE TO DELAY A DECISION ON THE MADISON THAT CAN HAVE LASTING POSITIVE EFFECTS ON THE RESOURCE!

Sincerely,

Mark Savinski
25 Sundowner Road
Sheridan, MT 59749

From: [Michael Bias](#)
To: [FWP Madison River COM](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] FOAM Comments Regarding Postponing Commercial Use Cap
Date: Thursday, August 4, 2022 6:40:09 PM
Attachments: [FOAM Comments Re Delayed Implementation.docx](#)

2 August 2022

Fish & Wildlife Commission
1420 East Sixth Avenue
P.O. Box 200701
Helena, Mt 59620-0701

Dear Commissioners and Director Worsech:

On behalf of the board of directors and over 1,000 professionally-licensed guide and outfitter members of the Fishing Outfitters Association of Montana (FOAM), I am writing to express our concern regarding the Montana Fish and Wildlife Commission's (Commission's) proposal to postpone implementation of a commercial use cap on the Madison River until after they adopt a method for allocating commercial-use trips to outfitters or a comprehensive river plan and rule package.

We understand that at their June 2022 meeting, the Commission felt that the restriction on rulemaking from October through December because of the upcoming legislative session would truncate public comment. We fully supported, at that time, that the Commission initiate the rulemaking process by putting the unanimous recommendations of the Madison Work Group out for public comment. We understand also the Commission's desire to fully engage the public through an alternative public scoping process, although we have seen no action from Fish, Wildlife & Parks (FWP) on this item yet.

With the upcoming working meeting of the Commission and Madison River Work Group (scheduled for 4 August 2022) along with FWP's commitment to public scoping of the Work Group's recommendations, we are fully committed and support working with the Commission and FWP to incorporate the Work Group's recommendations and public comment into a viable and comprehensive recreation management plan for the Madison River. As a past member of the Madison Negotiated Rulemaking Committee and current member of the Madison River Work Group, FOAM is committed to providing biologically-meaningful and adaptive recreation management recommendations to the Commission that will protect and conserve the renowned resource of the Madison River into the future.

Respectfully,
mike
Michael A. Bias, Ph.D.
Executive Director
Fishing Outfitters Association of Montana

From: [Ken Sinay](#)
To: [FWP Madison River COM](#)
Cc: ken@yellowstonenow.com
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Madison River Administrative Rule Hearing Comments
Date: Thursday, August 4, 2022 5:47:44 PM
Attachments: [August 4, 2022 MT FWP Madison river Administrative Rule Change Comments..docx](#)

August 4, 2022.

[This text is also attached as a Word document below, I sincerely hope my comments will be taken seriously. After 30 years, I see this as my last chance.]

To: Montana Fish, Wildlife, and Parks

Regarding:

Public Comment Hearing on Madison River Administrative Rule Change Implementation

From: Ken Sinay

POB 42, Bozeman, MT 59771

406-539-7359

Ken@YellowstoneNow.com

I support the proposal to postpone the administrative rule change.

The proposed “rule change” is harmful to non-fishing commercial operators, the public citizens served by those same non-fishing operators and the natural resources of the Madison River.

The Madison River Work Group(s), the MTFWP Commission(s), and MTFWP itself have continually ignored the comments I have made, and your own commercial use data, ever since evaluations were **first made** regarding Madison River use and resources.

I have been commenting, and offering alternative commercial wildlife viewing services prior to the creation of the Madison River SRP. These services have never been acknowledged by MT FWP. Even today, my Madison services are referred to as “scenic” tours.

There is a distinct “ignore-ance” of the non-fishing potential for commercial, social, conservation, and cultural education services regarding the Madison River.

This is distinctly indicated by the **public announcement** associated with the August 2, 2022 Rules Hearing on delaying implementation of the Madison River commercial use cap.

Note the fourth paragraph:

“In 2020, the Fish and Wildlife Commission adopted rules regarding recreational use of the Madison River. These rules included a commercial use cap that **would limit**

fishing outfitting and guiding for each outfitter and guide to the number of trips they reported in 2019 or 2020, whichever is higher.”

However, when the August 2 question/answer segment of the hearing began and I asked if this rule would be applied to non-fishing commercial services the answer was a definitive “Yes.”

The words “outfitter” and “guide” have legal definitions which do not apply to non-hunting, fishing or pursuit commercial services. Had I trusted the wording of MTFWP in the announcement, I would not be commenting today. It indicates a distinct bias, and this bias has impacts on services, the resource, the economy, and peoples’ lives.

This bias against commercial non-fishing wildlife observation services also neglects the sparse commercial use of the Madison River below Greycliff and particularly below Milwaukee Fishing Access.

This bias has been reflected in MTFWP and Commission statements to the media, at public meetings, in MTFWP staff behavior, and consequently in the various public scoping documents and ultimately in a public opinion which reflects an antipathy regarding “too many commercial operators” of any kind. Everyone thinks of fishing outfitters and guides

And, multiple times, like right now, it has been reflected in potential rule of law.

At one point, I was nearly completely shut down when it was proposed to halt all commercial “guiding” services from Greycliff downstream. I was, as you may suspect, shocked and very disappointed. It was only by conflict in the classic regions upstream that this did not occur.

Please understand, **my type of service is not part of any conflict. My type of service is an asset.**

Note that in a past Madison River EA, less than 0.014% of total commercial use occurred from **Milwaukee FAS to Headwaters FAS**. A tiny fraction over 1 hundredth of a percent!

Of the 3 miles total river reach, **only 2 miles are governed by the Madison River SRP**. Note too: **the floatable Madison River is 80 miles long!**

From Greycliff downstream, and particularly from Milwaukee downstream, there are **none of the issues for which the original SRP was designed to address and none of the social, fish, or environmental impacts which the “commercial cap” is intended to address.**

My personal, 30 year, history of commercial wildlife viewing services was predominately on this very river reach.

I have actual data, from every commercial and personal river tour I have ever experienced from Greycliff FAS to Headwaters FAS to demonstrate the occurrence of wildlife seen. I have observed no decline in any species with the exception of passerine birds. The decline in passerines follows a trend which is widespread across North America. In fact, my data probably exceeds any data MTFWP has collected at any time during the development of the SRP. My data and my commercial services can logically be considered of value to the management agencies, the public, and the resource because there is essentially no monitoring of change along the vast majority of the river corridor.

Is there monitoring and recognition of fish populations? Of course there is.

I firmly feel that the **resident and non-resident public, including children and physically challenged, deserve the opportunity to experience this region** (Greycliff to Headwaters) of valuable natural and cultural history.

During the Lewis and Clark Bicentennial years, 2003 to 2006, I would conduct 20 to 25 commercial river tours during a 4 month float season. At that time, and even today, I rarely see other floaters. I have never heard anyone complain or had any conflict with resources or people. Yet now, my potential is at risk of being limited. I have run fewer trips in recent years due to the incredible growth of National Park wildlife tourism. Now I wish to increase my services on rivers. I am simply asking for fair opportunity.

I hope that postponement will allow MT FWP and the FWP Commission to recognize the differences between the region from Greycliff upstream from Greycliff downstream.

A commercial cap on my type of service is a dis-service to the resource and the public. It is wrong and denies future potential, and is, frankly, unfair and unjustified.

From: [Andrew Billings](#)
To: [FWP Madison River COM](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Concern for Small Guide Operations
Date: Tuesday, August 2, 2022 3:29:58 PM

Fellow Outdoorsmen and Women,

We are reaching out because we feel that any implementation of a commercial cap at this point would set a bad precedent for small and up-coming guide operations on the Madison River and our valley. A commercial cap could put the control of the river into the hands of only a couple of larger outfitters and hurt smaller operations. We all love our river and the valley, but we should work to come up with a more comprehensive plan that works to encourage both sustainable use and grow small outfitting operations. Please delay the commercial cap until a strategic and thoughtful plan can be implemented. Thank you for your time and shared passion in the outdoors.

Best,
Drew and Paige Billings
Proud Montanans

From: [Josh Seckinger](#)
To: [FWP Madison River COM](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Madison Commerical Cap
Date: Monday, August 1, 2022 7:27:07 PM

The commercial use cap on the Madison River benefits only one class of people: large outfitters. It does not benefit the public, it does not benefit guides, nor does it benefit clients of the outfitters who stand to reap the most in rewards. It severely punishes those who have recently obtained their outfitters license, and puts guides who are considering becoming an outfitter that the Madison system is off limits.

Please DO NOT implement a cap on commercial use on the Madison system.

From: [Nancy @ Beartooth](#)
To: [FWP Madison River COM](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Please Do Not Delay Progress
Date: Monday, August 1, 2022 4:44:07 PM
Importance: High

Dear Commissioners, FWP, and Madison River Work Group,

After 13 years of delays and meetings on the Madison River process, we thought the Work Group had finally come to a point of progress where we could move forward and deal with the River and move on. Delaying again does not make sense as that may potentially end up another two years like other delays. Please reconsider accepting the proposals and put them into action and allow for the recreational use process to be accomplished as proposed. It truly is time to make progress and there seems to be more agreement at this point than we had seen in the past.

Thank you for yours and everyone's time and consideration.

Best Regards,

Nancy and Dan Delekta
Beartooth Flyfishing
406-682-7525

From: [ellisshane43](#)
To: [FWP Madison River COM](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Commercial Cap Objection.pdf
Date: Monday, August 1, 2022 9:51:53 AM
Attachments: [Commercial Cap Objection.pdf](#)

Good Morning,

Please see my attached objection for the commercial use cap set to take effect in January 2023. I hope you would consider modifying or completely rejecting the regulation at your upcoming hearing. Thank you for your time.

Shane Ellis

Sent from my Verizon, Samsung Galaxy smartphone

From: [Taylor Rickard](#)
To: [FWP Madison River COM](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Commercial use day cap
Date: Monday, August 1, 2022 7:09:04 AM

Good morning,

I am writing in hopes to postpone the commercial use day cap.

Ennis is one of the most beautiful places I've ever been. My fiancé and I plan to build our second home in the area. I think this new cap is going to hurt a lot of the small guiding business in the area. these business bring people to the area year round.

Not only does this new cap hurt the guiding business's but it will hurt the thriving environment of downtown Ennis. Less guiding services will result in people having to relocate which in the end means less traffic through the area meaning less business for all of the great places in town.

The fishing on the Maddison is already catch and release what's the harm in giving out more commercial use days or doing away with the idea completely?

I hope you consider the above points before the hearing this week.

Taylor Rickard
Nasm certified personal trainer

From: [Bruce Treichler](#)
To: [FWP Madison River COM](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] madison river
Date: Thursday, July 28, 2022 12:39:58 PM
Attachments: [mountain summit.docx](#)

July 25, 2022

From: Bruce Treichler

To: MFWP

Subject: Proposed Use Day Cap on the Madison River

I visit Montana to fish at least once every year. Consequently, I pay close attention to the fishing rules or restrictions on the rivers that I fish. But I always focus on the regulations for the Madison. I have fished it every year for the last ten years. When I was in Ennis in July, I learned that MFWP had proposed change in the use day cap. My understanding is that some outfitters, mostly the small ones, will be put out of business, while the larger outfitters will not be affected.

As I am sure you know, the rule change will not reduce the number of guides and their clients fishing the river on any given day. Nor will it reduce the number of local people or visitors who fish it without a guide. However, the rule change would force me to find another outfitter and guides who I do not know. As well there will be an impact on the economy of Ennis and Madison County.

I am urging you to reconsider this change and complete a comprehensive river plan that would take into account all of the factors of the proposed rule change.

You can contact me by phone at 360 951 7514
or climber22@earthlink.net.

If you have a mailing list, you can also mail materials to me at:

1752 Camden Park Drive SW

Olympia, Washington 98512

Bruce Treichler

Bruce Treichler

From: [Keith Brauneis](#)
To: [FWP Madison River COM](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Test email
Date: Thursday, July 28, 2022 12:21:47 PM

This is a test

From: [Delano Melikian](#)
To: [FWP Madison River COM](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Comments to Day Use Cap on the Madison River.
Date: Thursday, July 28, 2022 12:20:16 PM

To whom it may concern:

I am an enthusiastic outdoors buff and over the last few years have enjoyed fishing on the Madison meeting others fellow fishermen with whom I have established solid friendships.

In following the discussion and regulations, I strongly feel that Montana FWP should delay any implementation of a commercial use cap on the Madison.

The current ruling, as I see it, will predominately put the control of the river in a handful of larger outfitters...forcing the smaller outfitters, with whom I have been fishing, out of business.

This is bad practice for particularly for Ennis, where I spend most of my time, and the Madison Valley.

I kindly ask you to please delay any ruling at this time and encourage you to please continue discussions on a more comprehensive river management plan that will take into account the interest of all those engaged in the discovery of the Beautiful Madison River.

Thank you sincerely and humbly for your kind consideration.

*Delano Melikian
Mobile no. +1(310)505 8970*

From: [willie blazer](#)
To: [FWP Madison River COM](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Madison River - Postpone Use Day Cap
Date: Monday, July 25, 2022 2:33:42 PM

Hello-

I feel strongly that the Montana FWP should delay any implementation of a commercial use cap on the Madison River. The current ruling will primarily put the control of the river in a handful of larger outfitters, which will force smaller outfitters out of business. This is bad practice for our town and our Madison Valley. Please delay any ruling until a time when a more comprehensive river management plan can be designed for all.

Thanks,
Willie Blazer

From: [Beth Paradiso](#)
To: [FWP Madison River COM](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Use Day Cap
Date: Monday, July 25, 2022 12:41:36 PM

Hello,

I strongly feel that Montana FWP should delay any implementation of a commercial use cap on the Madison. The current ruling, as I see it, will predominately put the control of the river in a handful of larger outfitters; forcing the smaller outfitters out of business. This is bad practice for Ennis and the Madison Valley. Please delay any ruling until a time when a more comprehensive river management plan can be designed.

Thank you

Sent from my iPhone

From: [kevin.omalley](mailto:kevin.omalley@fwpmadison.com)
To: [FWP Madison River COM](mailto:FWP.Madison.River.COM)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Madison River commercial use cap
Date: Monday, July 25, 2022 10:52:30 AM

To Those it may concern-

As a longtime visitor to the Madison Valley and fly fisherman, I strongly oppose the proposed commercial use cap plan...

Particularly I have grown connected to the town of Ennis and the people and families that rely upon visitors such as myself for their livelihood...

The commercial use cap as proposed will adversely affect, not only the smaller outfitters that provide superior hospitality, service and attention to detail in order to build repeat business and ongoing regional economic viability and plurality...but this cap will anoint but a few outfitters with a virtual and actual monopoly on outfitting/guiding the Mighty Madison River. And there goes any real service and attention to detail as younger less experienced seasonal guides are employed from out of the area who have no connection to the region but provide those few anointed outfitters with a better profit margin...

Big Sky values should ring of freedom and fairness...please delay this fundamentally flawed commercial use cap plan! A more comprehensive...and transparently fair plan that allows those Stakeholders across the economic spectrum, including lodging restaurant, and other tourism dollar producing businesses, need be considered and implemented.

C'mon people...Montana is better than this and should lead the way in balanced conservation and economic fairness...

I feel the freedom of America and the strength of Montana when I am there...

But the current plan guts me like "business as usual" in Washington DC and Sacramento, and other such sellout places...

Be different, Montana...be better! Show us why Big Sky Country is the place to spend our money and support all Montana Stakeholders.

I welcome any return discussion or real dialogue...

Kevin O'Malley

The Madison Valley

Sent from my iPhone

From: [Todd Wynne-Parry](#)
To: [FWP Madison River COM](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Against Use Day Cap
Date: Monday, July 25, 2022 7:54:17 AM

Hello,

I understand there may be restrictions put on outfitters using the Madison River. I personally find this type of regulation to fly in the face of both logic and more importantly conservation. Why would you restrict the use of the river by the one group whose entire livelihood depends on the long-term custodianship of a strong and healthy fishery? What outcome from this restriction are you hoping to achieve? Is it damage to the river eco-system? Then you are focusing on the wrong group.

I strongly feel that Montana FWP should not move forward with any implementation of a commercial use cap on the Madison. The current ruling, will predominately put the control of the river in a handful of larger outfitters, forcing the smaller outfitters out of business and make zero positive impact on the river by all other users. This type of governance may be well meaning and progressive, but fails horribly in practice and hurts Ennis, the Madison Valley and most importantly the river and its fragile ec-system.

Please tap the brakes and adjust course to focus on what you are trying to achieve and tax or restrict any other group than the one whose entire enterprise depends on supporting the Madison River eco-system for now and all future generations.

Todd Wynne-Parry
Montana FWP ALS# 05091965-77
Madison River Foundation Donor

Sent from my iPhone

From: jonlang06@gmail.com
To: [FWP Madison River COM](mailto:FWP_Madison_River_COM)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Please start the commercial use cap
Date: Sunday, July 24, 2022 8:34:32 PM

Hello

To whom this concerns. My name is Jon Lang from Ravalli County and I ask that you do put in place the commercial use cap for guides on Jan 1. It sounds like it's going to be fair to the guides using 19-20 numbers. Some of which turned out to be great years for guides. We do not need a runway system, that before we know it , the rivers are too packed to enjoy and these resource feels to much stress .

Thank you all for hearing this .

Sent from my iPhone

From: [Don Goodman](#)
To: [FWP Madison River COM](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] outfitting days
Date: Sunday, July 24, 2022 10:42:52 AM

i know the outfitters will flood the phonedlines so wanted to be heard from this way. outfitters should have less time, not more. they are raping the rivers the way it is!!

From: [MaryAnn Griffith](#)
To: [FWP Madison River COM](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL]
Date: Thursday, July 21, 2022 3:46:05 PM

Commercial cap implementation

I feel there is no reason to hold off implementing the cap for guided fishing trips, etc. We have all the data needed already to show that more and more guides are taking up space from the locals that have been here for along time and can no longer fish like theyusedto. Hunting,rafting,fishing and hiking with dogs running amuck have become ridiculous. Think of us locals. We deserve to get our chances to get our fish and meat for the winter.