## COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Thursday, September 15, 2022 10:38:03 AM
Last Modified:	Thursday, September 15, 2022 10:39:08 AM
Time Spent:	00:01:04
IP Address:	72.250.178.228

Page 1

# Q1

Contact info (optional)

Name

Dave Toelke

# Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

I support manage elk where they are not

#### COMPLETE

Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Thursday, September 15, 2022 10:37:21 AM
Thursday, September 15, 2022 10:39:41 AM
00:02:20
65.121.126.226

#### Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	ROBERT LIVESAY
City/Town	MISSOULA
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	MARK@ULTRAMAXSPORTS.COM

### Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

How about allowing the use of electronic calls for bears? This is so much safer for the hunter and this could help bear harvest in these over predation regions. Montana FWP should really take a hard look at how Idaho is managing wolves and bears. They are aggressive on both and it is dramatically improving the situation. Montana is completely lagging behind and the evidence is clear in Region 1 and 2.

#### COMPLETE

Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Thursday, September 15, 2022 11:03:07 AM
Thursday, September 15, 2022 11:08:17 AM
00:05:09
161.7.109.252

#### Page 1

### **Q1**

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Billy Peterman
City/Town	Helena
State/Province	МТ

### Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Recommendations from workgroup are short-sighted and focus too much on predators in NW Montana. Bigger picture thought is required to solve this dilemma. Improve forage and habitat on public land, reduce grazing pressure from cattle on public land, work with landowners and agencies to improve knowledge and action on migration, reduce limiting factors in areas where under objective, reduce hunting pressure on public land in areas that are over objective, work with counties to reduce the impact of increasing development. Secure a future for elk in ALL areas of Montana

## COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Thursday, September 15, 2022 2:41:42 PM
Last Modified:	Thursday, September 15, 2022 2:50:03 PM
Time Spent:	00:08:21
IP Address:	107.191.172.108

## Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	William Purdy
City/Town	Libby
State/Province	MT
Email Address	bjpurdymt80@gmail.com

# Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

There are a lot of very good points here. Along with the lack of forest management, predation has been a problem. I feel that we definitely have more elk in region 1 than the counts indicate, but getting a handle on predator numbers would definitely help our elk out.

# COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Thursday, September 15, 2022 2:55:14 PM
Last Modified:	Thursday, September 15, 2022 2:55:46 PM
Time Spent:	00:00:31
IP Address:	184.166.243.68

# Page 1

# Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Stan Buchholz
City/Town	Billings
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	smbuchholz@peoplepc.com

# Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Does FWP really know why numbers are so low?

# COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Thursday, September 15, 2022 6:52:44 PM
Last Modified:	Thursday, September 15, 2022 6:57:18 PM
Time Spent:	00:04:34
IP Address:	107.191.170.82
IP Address:	107.191.170.82

## Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Christopher Wolfgang Holliday
City/Town	Libby
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	radongas@centric.net

# Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Okay, so you are admitting failure with the stupid hound hunting regulations you guys came up with. But more useless attempts by you guys are not going to change a goddamned thing. Every time a bear is euthanized it is because of your management failure. Try to get out of your own way!

# COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Thursday, September 15, 2022 7:16:00 PM
Last Modified:	Thursday, September 15, 2022 7:30:35 PM
Time Spent:	00:14:35
IP Address:	71.229.237.143

# Page 1

# **Q1**

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Don Schwandt
City/Town	Colorado Springs
State/Province	со
Email Address	dehunts@msn.com

#### Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Add to this recommendation to help make it a more robust predator management program that is desperately needed in so many units. See below for ideas:

Mountain Lions:

No Mountain Lion Harvest Quota. Remove male and female mountain lion quotas statewide. There will be a mandatory check of all harvested mountain lions. Spotted kittens and females with spotted kittens prohibited. Annual bag limit is two adult mountain lions of either sex

Allow Resident and non-residents purchase a second half priced mountain lion tag for any unit with designated wilderness or has a wilderness study in it.

#### Wolves:

No Limit, not a daily or season limit on wolves. No person may take more wolves than the number of legal tags they possess. Either sex may be taken.

Electronic Calls: E-calls may be used to attract wolves.

Resident and Nonresident Deer or Elk tags: Hunters may use an unfilled nonresident deer or elk tag to take a gray wolf during the open season corresponding to the deer or elk tag hunt area or unit when gray wolf season is also open.

Allow baiting for wolf hunting on private lands with landowner permission. It is not legal to use edible meat portions of any game bird or animal, except legally salvaged roadkill. Wolves may be taken incidentally to bear baiting.

Allow extended hours for hunting wolves. The hunter may take wolves outside of hunting hours, only if: On private land, the hunter is the landowner or has written permission from the landowner to hunt outside of hunting hours.

#### Black Bear:

Allow resident and non-residents purchase a second half priced black bear tag for any unit with designated wilderness or has a wilderness study in it.

Electronic calls may be used black bear hunting

Established a spring Black Bear Baiting season for hunting. April 15 - June 15. Bait is any substance placed to attract game animals. Bait may be used to hunt black bears but only under the following conditions:

No parts of animals or fish that are currently classified as game animals or game fish in Montana may be used as bait. This includes game animals and fish that come from the wild and commercial domestic sources (i.e., pen-raised game birds/ animals or hatchery-raised game fish).

The skin must be removed from any mammal parts or carcasses used as bait.

No person shall use salt in any form (liquid or solid) for bait. Time: No bait or bait containers may be placed for the purpose of

#### Recommendation #11: We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not

attracting or taking black bears before the opening of black bear take season, except in Units with designated wilderness or wilderness study in it where bait may be placed up to 7 days before the take season.

All bait containers and materials must be removed, and all excavations refilled, no later than 7 days after the close of spring, fall, or dog training season. Location:

No bait site may be located within 200 feet of any water (lake, pond, reservoir, or year-round free-flowing stream or spring).

No bait site may be located within 200 yards from any maintained trail or any established roadway that is open to the public for motorized traffic and capable of being traveled by full-sized automobiles. An established roadway is defined as any road that is established, built, maintained, approved, or designated by any government entity or private landowner for the purpose of travel by full-sized automobiles. An established roadway shows evidence of repeated use by full-sized automobiles and may include a traveled way of natural earth with depressed wheel tracks and little or no vegetation in the tracks.

No bait site may be located within one-half mile of any designated campground or picnic area, administrative site, or dwelling. Containers:

No bait may be contained within paper, plastic, glass, metal, wood, or other nonbiodegradable materials, except that a single metal container with a maximum size of 55 gallons may be used if securely attached at the bait site.

No bait may be contained in any excavated hole greater than 4 feet in diameter. Establishment of Bait Sites: Any structures constructed at bait sites and all materials must be removed by the permit holder within 7 days after the close of the spring and fall black bear seasons.

All bait sites must be visibly marked at the nearest tree or on the bait container using a site tag issued by Fish and Game. Baiting Permits: All persons placing bait must possess a baiting permit issued by Fish and Game. Baiting permits are issued by mail or in person at Fish and Game offices beginning March 1 of each year.

Baiting permits will be valid in the calendar year for which they are issued.

A hunter may possess only one Fish and Game baiting permit each year and may maintain up to three bait sites. The number of bait sites maintained by licensed outfitters may be specified by the land management agency in the outfitter's operating plan.

Bait site tags are valid for spring and fall seasons in the calendar year for which they are issued. No person may hunt over an unlawful bait site.

Guides and clients of outfitters are not required to obtain a baiting permit, but they must have a copy of the outfitter's permit in their possession while hunting over a bait site.

Possession of a Fish and Game baiting permit does not exempt the permit holder from any restrictions

Establish a Predator Bounty Program much like the South Dakota Nest Predator Bounty Program for: Coyotes, Red Foxes, Raccoons, Skunks, Badgers

## COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Thursday, September 15, 2022 8:06:12 PM
Last Modified:	Thursday, September 15, 2022 8:09:08 PM
Time Spent:	00:02:55
IP Address:	72.174.65.30

## Page 1

# Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Ben Hart
City/Town	Missoula
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	dryflies@gmail.com

# Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

We have to use science to base elk population objectives on the carrying capacity of the land! Elk "objectives" are arbitrary and in many cases represent nothing more than landowner tolerance. The objective numbers are TOO LOW in many districts.

## COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Friday, September 16, 2022 12:49:10 AM
Last Modified:	Friday, September 16, 2022 12:54:35 AM
Time Spent:	00:05:25
IP Address:	98.97.38.20

## Page 1

## **Q1**

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Jerry McGuire
City/Town	Thompson Falls
State/Province	MT
Email Address	mangeymoose@yahoo.com

# Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

I challenge the Wildlife Biologists in Region 1 to put together a plan to bring back elk number to historic levels, for sportsman review. After all you are the professional Biologist.

# COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Friday, September 16, 2022 8:57:27 AM
Last Modified:	Friday, September 16, 2022 9:15:12 AM
Time Spent:	00:17:44
IP Address:	65.19.244.226

# Page 1

# Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Nate Thompson
City/Town	Ramsay
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	natethompson11@live.com

### Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

From reading FWP's responses, I can sympathize with the situation FWP is in.

FWP has the responsibility to manage the animal population, but does not have the direct ultimate responsibility to manage the overall environment that population lives in.

This proposal seems to indicate that predator populations are number one issue for where animal populations no longer are.

I can see maybe small, isolated areas where that's the case.

However, throughout Western Montana, the biggest impediment to animal movement or harboring, is dead fall and new growth in old clear cuts.

#### Two great examples:

- Moose Creek Trailhead to Red Mountain in HD 340, especially by Highlands Campground. The dead fall is so thick a bull elk cannot physically move through thousands of acres of public land. When there's snow, and you're tracking elk, you can tell which tracks are a bull/or bulls because of the areas they physically have to skirt because the dead fall prevents antlers from being able to squeeze through. This prevents natural elk movement and harboring in thousands of acres of public land. New growth in old timber harvest areas is also so thick now, the only things that live in there are squirrels.

- Good Creek area west of Whitefish. Clear cuts used to be the only place you could hunt because in the trees dead fall so thick you cannot move. Of course mountain lions and bears love an area like that because they adapt far better than elk to such a mess.

However, any time there's a project to actually be good stewards of the land, everything gets derailed by a judge out of Missoula. Seems anymore that forests are deliberately mismanaged so that fires are more and more prevalent and intense. Everyone I talk to, says that basically the best thing to do with a forest fire is to follow it, make slash piles, burn everything because that's how far gone we've allowed our forests to become.

Clean up the forests, be good stewards, and we will see a healthier ecosystem in general. But, the deliberate attempts to prevent good stewardship really prevent this proposal from being achievable.

# COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Friday, September 16, 2022 10:06:11 AM
Last Modified:	Friday, September 16, 2022 10:09:05 AM
Time Spent:	00:02:54
IP Address:	97.121.192.238

## Page 1

## **Q1**

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Marc Murfitt
City/Town	Bozeman
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	marc@tsopmt.com

# Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Manage the damn wolves! It's the only solution to increase the population of elk. Yes, it's that simple. Short of killing excessive Arctic grey wolves nothing will change.

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Friday, September 16, 2022 1:15:24 PM
Last Modified:	Friday, September 16, 2022 1:19:55 PM
Time Spent:	00:04:31
IP Address:	204.124.92.253

Page 1

### Q1

Respondent skipped this question

## Contact info (optional)

# Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

This is a good proposal. Every since the Wolf ruined hunting in the western half of the state the eastern half has been bombarded with hunters, who brought with them their knap weed and leafy spurge. They totally ruined some native range lands in the Missouri Breaks. I believe this proposal would solve a lot of issues if it is feasible. It is a way better idea than choose your weapon. It distributes people naturally rather than reducing opportunity it increases opportunity. You could trap a bunch of elk from the overpopulated areas to repopulate those areas ruined by the wolves.

## COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Friday, September 16, 2022 2:34:27 PM
Last Modified:	Friday, September 16, 2022 2:35:14 PM
Time Spent:	00:00:46
IP Address:	63.153.109.221
Time Spent:	00:00:46

Page 1

# Q1

Respondent skipped this question

Contact info (optional)

# Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

We would have lots of elk if you just killed the wolf plan and simple

## COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Friday, September 16, 2022 5:49:53 PM
Last Modified:	Friday, September 16, 2022 5:51:30 PM
Time Spent:	00:01:37
IP Address:	72.250.189.114

# Page 1

# Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Thomas McGary
City/Town	Columbia Falls
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	thomasmcgary888@gmail.com

# Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Yes improve elk hunting in the northwest corner of the state.

## COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Saturday, September 17, 2022 5:40:48 AM
Last Modified:	Saturday, September 17, 2022 5:45:26 AM
Time Spent:	00:04:38
IP Address:	66.109.159.12

## Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Howard Morkert
City/Town	Trout Creek
State/Province	MT
Email Address	lhmork@blackfoot.net

# Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

The elk herd in Region 1 have been devastated by excessive predator populations. Predator control and elimination is the only option to restore elk populations to historical numbers. In many cases the elk are forced on to private ground increasing landowner conflicts also.

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Saturday, September 17, 2022 9:24:47 AM
Last Modified:	Saturday, September 17, 2022 9:28:37 AM
Time Spent:	00:03:50
IP Address:	184.167.198.148

## Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	L.Sherm Russell
City/Town	Havre
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	russellmdc@gmail.com

### **Q2**

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Arial " recreational " hunting is banned by federal law, it is NOT by state or federal management purposes. Why do we think of more reasons not to do something than reasons to do something? Providing a blanket statement to Arial hunting of wolves is wrong, there is a way lawfully, use the tools available to reduce the numbers in Region 1

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Sunday, September 18, 2022 4:22:19 PM
Last Modified:	Sunday, September 18, 2022 4:29:11 PM
Time Spent:	00:06:51
IP Address:	174.198.143.59

#### Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	John Daggett
City/Town	Glasgow
State/Province	MT
Email Address	jdaggett435@gmail.com

### Q2

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

There has been a boom in human development in NW Montana in the last 40 years. The human population has also spikes. There are also some type of motorized use extensively using public land. Maybe the elk have moved over the devide to less congested areas. There has also been alot of fire the last 25 years in NW Montana, so why aren't elk using these burned areas including in the wilderness. Maybe, the elk discovered rances to the east that don't have all the human activity? Blaming it all on wolves might not be correct. This passed year, there were not anymore wolves taken than in years past. Even though the ways of taking them have been expanded to the point trappers can be compensated for their effort. How is that working?

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Sunday, September 18, 2022 8:12:52 PM
Last Modified:	Sunday, September 18, 2022 8:27:42 PM
Time Spent:	00:14:49
IP Address:	50.52.65.223

#### Page 1

### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Scott Hanson
City/Town	Libby
State/Province	MT
Email Address	scottehanson@protonmail.com

### Q2

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

I can support the "title" of this recommendation and the underlying idea that there should be active game management in areas that have seen declining populations of game and do support predator control and am pleased that the commission is taking steps to address the mountain lion population in NW Montana. But I also believe that this ties in with cooperation with other authorities such as USFS, BLM, DNRC and private timber companies to improve habitat for game animals. Over the past few years there have been pushes by several groups to restrict harvest of deer and elk and have gained lots of initial public support but did so often times by misleading the public and omitting information. These are the people that supported the 103-50 mule deer permit and sold it to the public as a way to save the mule deer when their sole purpose was to shoot bigger bucks from the road, and simultaneously support reducing mountain lion harvest in region 1 for the "hunt satisfaction", and support hunting bears with hounds for predator control, and to them the only good wolf is a dead wolf. If we are going to "manage elk where they are not" we need to look at the root cause of a population decline and address what actions can be taken to remedy the problem.

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Monday, September 19, 2022 7:38:18 AM
Last Modified:	Monday, September 19, 2022 7:42:44 AM
Time Spent:	00:04:26
IP Address:	66.62.89.101

#### Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Jeff Darrah
City/Town	Stevensville
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	jdarrah21@gmail.com

### **Q2**

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

This is a very important recommendation that as the executive director of MTSFW, our organization fully supports. The balance between predators and prey is important to us as sportsmen. R1 has less than 3,000 elk in the entire Region, but it leads the state in Grizzly Bear numbers, it leads the state in wolves harvested, it leads the state in black bears harvested, and it has a substantial lion population. The recovery of elk in this region will not occur without proper apex predator management.

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Monday, September 19, 2022 10:17:28 AM
Last Modified:	Monday, September 19, 2022 10:24:21 AM
Time Spent:	00:06:53
IP Address:	47.45.180.253

#### Page 1

### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Gary L Moses
City/Town	Kalispell
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	mobilt13@gmail.com

### Q2

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

WOW!! This proposal is unbelievable, not based on on science and biological knowledge, and appears written by those aimed at increasing wolf tags. I am a "consumptive" member of the public, a hunter, and I do not support the recommendation. I also understand that elk numbers of the past were due to the lack of predators, and wolves are just one component of an ecosystem just as fire, forestry, and human encroachment and development of habitat are. Aerial harvest does not effectively control wild pig numbers in Texas, how would it be effective in densely forested Region 1, other than to give anti-hunters more fuel to campaign for the elimination of hunting? This proposal needs to be in the trash can, NOW.

## COMPLETE

Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Monday, September 19, 2022 10:58:36 AM
Monday, September 19, 2022 11:03:52 AM
00:05:16
98.127.139.81

# Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Mike Richard
City/Town	Helena
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	mhrichard11@gmail.com

# Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Great idea! There's so much country in this state that could inhabit more elk.

### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Monday, September 19, 2022 11:44:29 AM
Last Modified:	Monday, September 19, 2022 11:49:05 AM
Time Spent:	00:04:36
IP Address:	216.228.57.82

#### Page 1

### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Andrew Wright
City/Town	Ekalaka
State/Province	MT
Email Address	mighty_hunter69@hotmail.com

## **Q2**

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

To manage elk where they are is a tough subject we started to see elk population grow drastically after the reintroduction of wolves to greater Yellowstone ecosystem, the majority of western Mt is open to general elk tag there are sub permits in areas yes but you need to manage the hunting pressure and predators (wolves, grizzlies, mountain lion and coyotes) along with hunting pressure before your going to change much. You could trap and relocate elk via brucellosis testing from over objective areas as well.

### COMPLETE

Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Tuesday, September 20, 2022 7:16:18 AM
Tuesday, September 20, 2022 7:25:36 AM
00:09:18
63.153.66.208

#### Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Keith Kubista
City/Town	Stevensville MT
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	kredtailhawk@gmail.com

### **Q2**

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

This is a worthy recommendation to explore and use some of the prescriptions from the list, such as putting more pressure on wolves, black bears, lions. The number one action that needs to be taken is to work on grizzly bear delisting and to preserve hunting of grizzlies when that occurs. Habitat improvement will not create or improve elk calf recruitment unless predators are kept at lower levels.

### COMPLETE

Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Tuesday, September 20, 2022 12:13:34 PM
Tuesday, September 20, 2022 12:34:03 PM
00:20:28
209.137.240.222

#### Page 1

### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	John Bussard
City/Town	Anaconda
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	Jbussard3@me.com

### Q2

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

The absolute best idea/thought to come out of the Elk Management Citizen Advisory Group . As a former resident of regions 1 and 2 and now a resident of region 3, I could not agree more with the author of this proposal. This recommendation alone would completely mitigate all of the other temporary stop-gap measures that are being discussed to solve problems that do not address the core issue. FWP continues to ignore this fact and loves to pretend it doesn't exist. When I lived in the Flathead I was way better off to spend 6-8 hours in the truck every weekend to get to and from decent hunting areas. To spend a weekend up there looking for game was a total waste of time and unproductive. We need to collaborate with the Forest and reduce the timber and open up the forest completely during the winter predator seasons because we need to manage them more effectively. The FWP also needs to stop with all the WMA's that shut out winter predator hunting and cuts off access to get into the WMA's to effectively hunt. Elk do not care one bit about a snowmobile or truck on a road once the guns stop shooting at them. Please stop creating predator buffet areas and open up the ones already created.

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Tuesday, September 20, 2022 2:18:46 PM
Last Modified:	Tuesday, September 20, 2022 2:22:34 PM
Time Spent:	00:03:48
IP Address:	161.7.39.7

Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)

State/Province

MT

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

As a Montana resident hunter I support the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not. Living in central Montana I see many hunters from the NW side of the state. They come over here simply because its where the elk are. We should try to return elk their historical ranges to help not only elk and predators numbers but hunter numbers. More access to elk will help with FWP's R3 initiative as well.

#### COMPLETE

Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Tuesday, September 20, 2022 2:31:50 PM
Tuesday, September 20, 2022 2:33:46 PM
00:01:55
64.25.130.250

#### Page 1

### **Q1**

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Brian Connelly
City/Town	MISSOULA
State/Province	MT
Email Address	allhourspainting@gmail.com

### Q2

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

More roads and driving access is the problem, not the answer to the problem. Studies have shown that elk give roads a wide berth, up to one mile on either side. The more that roads are driven, the less elk use those areas. This pushes elk onto less accessible landsplaces further than most will walk or onto private. Increasing fines and enforcement of road closures should increase not decrease.

#### COMPLETE

Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Tuesday, September 20, 2022 7:06:24 PM
Tuesday, September 20, 2022 7:11:45 PM
00:05:20
162.244.172.88

#### Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Ben Goodrich
City/Town	Eureka
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	bgoodrich@terrapower.com

### Q2

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

I live in Region 1. Terribly managed forests. Elk will thrive in good habitat and with few predators. Common sense. Never seen more poorly managed forests than in Region 1. Logging does what fires used to do... keep the mountains fresh with new and rotating habitat. The lack of logging and clearing makes for unhealthy fire-prone forests that are devoid of life. Stop using poor forestry management as a game management tool. Populations are embarrassing. Expanding trapping and legality of shooting a wolf year-round would help too but less so than giving those critters more healthy habitats.

# COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Wednesday, September 21, 2022 7:13:56 AM
Last Modified:	Wednesday, September 21, 2022 7:14:46 AM
Time Spent:	00:00:50
IP Address:	107.77.221.18

## Page 1

## **Q1**

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Sean Hoernke
City/Town	Montgomery
State/Province	тх
Email Address	hoernke@hotmail.com

# Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

In order to get hunting pressure back to Western Montana you have to get rid of the Grizzly Bear. People want to enjoy themselves not be on the food chain.

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Wednesday, September 21, 2022 9:10:52 AM
Last Modified:	Wednesday, September 21, 2022 9:18:42 AM
Time Spent:	00:07:50
IP Address:	71.36.52.253

#### Page 1

### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Howard Mee
City/Town	Columbia Falls
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	eye_fly99@yahoo.com

### Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

I feel like one of the Old Timers complaining about the Good-Old-Days. Less than 10 years ago, there was a 5 mile stretch of gated roads here in the NW where I could hear 10 separate bugles. This wasn't a freak day, it was repeatable. This 2022 season, I have not heard a single bugle. Unfortunately, that has become the new normal.

As a result, we now leave the NW corner and chase elk (with everyone else) in other parts of the state. I saw more hunters "Down South" that ever before. I have to acknowledge that I AM PART OF THE PROBLEM. I add to the pressure in "Southern Montana". Please take this recommendation seriously. Please give NW MT a chance. We have the acreage and the habitat. I would love to be able to show me children elk here at home and not have to drive 4-5 hours, stand shoulder to shoulder with some guys from Minnesota, just to hear an elk bugle. Thank you.

# COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Wednesday, September 21, 2022 12:21:17 PM
Last Modified:	Wednesday, September 21, 2022 12:26:10 PM
Time Spent:	00:04:52
IP Address:	64.25.134.113

## Page 1

# **Q1**

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Jeff Smith
City/Town	Trout creek
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	jwstrapper@gmail.com

# Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

I am for all of the recommendations. Wolf predation has to be slowed down. Trapping season needs to start in October in region 1.

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Thursday, September 22, 2022 1:15:07 PM
Last Modified:	Thursday, September 22, 2022 1:19:59 PM
Time Spent:	00:04:51
IP Address:	72.174.2.96

#### Page 1

### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	robert hanneman
City/Town	Florence
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	trapperjr@hotmail.com

### Q2

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Until you have mandatory hunter reporting on all elk tags you guys are never going to catch up with the rest of the west. Honestly with Biologist getting a couple flights a year if you are lucky how can the do there job the best they can? How about we give them the harvest data from their units. It laughable MT is still not doing this for every tag sold. I do realize that with the new E-Tag option they will get the data from the hunters that selected the E-Tag option. It would be interesting to know how many hunters selected that for 2022. Robert Hanneman

## COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Friday, September 23, 2022 8:04:58 AM
Last Modified:	Friday, September 23, 2022 8:05:57 AM
Time Spent:	00:00:59
IP Address:	172.58.47.15

## Page 1

## **Q1**

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Daniel Roope
City/Town	Helena
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	dsmjroope@aol.com

# Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Sounds like a waste of money to MANAGE THEM WHERE THEY AREN'T! Just sayin!

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Friday, September 23, 2022 11:44:49 AM
Last Modified:	Friday, September 23, 2022 11:45:26 AM
Time Spent:	00:00:36
IP Address:	69.145.223.79

#### Page 1

### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Randall Knowles
City/Town	Great Falls
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	KnowlesMontana@Juno.com

### Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

We have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not

Lewis & Clark almost starved to death crossing the mountains in western Montana. A paper presented in 2007 specifically addressing the dwindling elk herds in NW Montana concluded that habitat and predators were the primary factor in elk calf mortality. In addition, the data seems to indicate that NW Montana has very limited Public Access [where the elk are]. https://wildlifemanagement.institute/sites/default/files/2016-09/13-Cause-Specific\_Mortality.pdf

Transplanting elk in an area and thinking that they will thrive can be a fool's errand. Similar to wasting 5 million dollars on raising pheasants; money which would be much better spent on habitat and access.

Money identified for transplanting, in NW Montana, might be better spent on acquiring conservation easements and land. Elk thrive on and around all of the Wildlife Management Areas.

We put mountain sheep in the Belts and the mountain lions ate very well that winter.

Biologists have identified parts of Montana that would support elk, in eastern Montana, we have just not moved them there yet. We must remember, man forced wildlife into the mountains. The only item hunted in the mountains by native Montanan's was poles for their tepees. Lewis & Clark had lots of wildlife to harvest until the entered the mountains.

## COMPLETE

Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Friday, September 23, 2022 3:56:42 PM
Friday, September 23, 2022 3:57:29 PM
00:00:47
174.215.24.156

## Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Drew Merten
City/Town	Missoula
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	drewmerten@hotmail.com

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

I am in support of predator management and restoring elk numbers to NW MT.

## COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Sunday, September 25, 2022 11:25:08 AM
Last Modified:	Sunday, September 25, 2022 11:27:24 AM
Time Spent:	00:02:15
IP Address:	69.145.51.139

## Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
-------------------------	--

Name	ALLEN CUNNINGTON
City/Town	BILLINGS
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	aattcc@charter.net

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Only by controlling the predator population can this be completed.

### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Sunday, September 25, 2022 5:43:13 PM
Last Modified:	Sunday, September 25, 2022 5:46:39 PM
Time Spent:	00:03:26
IP Address:	98.97.39.45

### Page 1

#### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Carl Mehmke
City/Town	Great falls
State/Province	MT
Email Address	skidoomehmke@aol.com

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

This proposal is so broad based it's hard to understand. At face value it sounds like the population data in district 1 is at best out dated and at worst none existent. Fix this first so we'll can all have an intelligent conversation on where to go from there.

## COMPLETE

2 9:36:09 PM
2 9:38:15 PM

## Page 1

## Q1

Ken Wise
Milltown
MT
kandd@bresnan.net

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

This could help if the elk were removed from non-accessible private land and relocated to public land.

## COMPLETE

Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Monday, September 26, 2022 12:25:23 PM
Monday, September 26, 2022 12:26:00 PM
00:00:36
69.145.98.22

### Page 1

## Q1

### Contact info (optional)

Name	Andy
City/Town	Helena
State/Province	МТ

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

I'm in favor of this. More elk in those areas is always a good thing. And I like the idea of additional, well-informed predator management

### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Thursday, September 29, 2022 10:23:42 PM
Last Modified:	Thursday, September 29, 2022 10:30:07 PM
Time Spent:	00:06:24
IP Address:	174.215.16.218

### Page 1

### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Timothy Wiediger
City/Town	Hamilton
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	shedhuntin@gmail.com

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

YES!!! CONTROL PREDATORS!!! Wolf,bear, mountain lion, and let's not forget the crafty hunter the Coyote they hunt in packs also and are devastating to the new calfs and fawns and also the small game animals. I personally feel that coyotes are flying under the radar! Put a bounty on them!

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Friday, September 30, 2022 1:00:06 PM
Last Modified:	Friday, September 30, 2022 1:00:35 PM
Time Spent:	00:00:29
IP Address:	72.174.3.184

#### Page 1

#### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Kevin Farron
City/Town	Missoula
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	kevin@backcountryhunters.org

#### **Q2**

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Dear FWP and the Elk Management Citizen Advisory Group -

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on your 'Manage Elk Where They Are Not' proposal.

There's a lot to unpack here and the Department's responses point to many 'not legal' or 'not feasible' reactions to these proposals. For this reason, Montana BHA will not address those.

As FWP noted in their response, our main concern with elk management in NW Montana is the habitat. We have and continue to encourage FWP and other land management agencies to invest more in habitat improvements, prescribed burning, thinning projects and more.

Thank you again for the opportunity to comment on your 'Manage Elk Where They Are Not' proposal. We appreciate your careful consideration.

-The Montana Chapter of Backcountry Hunters & Anglers

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Monday, October 03, 2022 8:25:02 PM
Last Modified:	Monday, October 03, 2022 8:28:09 PM
Time Spent:	00:03:06
IP Address:	98.127.133.110

#### Page 1

### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Jeff Bartos
City/Town	Helena
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	jbartos322@gmail.com

#### **Q2**

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

This is an absurd, anti-wolf proposal at its core, and will not address the root cause of low elk numbers in region 1, which is habitat loss. The two major predators of elk in the area are mountain lions and black bears, while this targets wolves. Furthermore, liberalizing the hunting regulation for increased wolf harvest risks their relisting on the endangered species act, which would limit state management. Relocate some elk? Great. This proposal? Not great.

#### COMPLETE

Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Monday, October 03, 2022 10:28:08 PM
Monday, October 03, 2022 10:35:54 PM
00:07:46
65.125.255.158

#### Page 1

### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Nathan Olson
City/Town	MT - Missoula
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	woodlawn@outlook.com

#### Q2

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

I agree with the general comment. Elk across region 1 and 2 have been managed to unrealistically low numbers by FWP (as mandated by the legislature), and this should change. Habitat, public and private land access and use keep changing, and the goals in these regions have not kept up with the changes. In many way we do not know what the future holds. Large fires can change carrying capacities in districts in short order, and climate change with shorter winters are also likely to have additional effects on this analysis. We should and can have more elk in Region 1 and 2, which can help pressure issues in other areas.

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Tuesday, October 04, 2022 8:27:28 AM
Last Modified:	Tuesday, October 04, 2022 8:33:49 AM
Time Spent:	00:06:20
IP Address:	47.44.112.2

#### Page 1

#### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Austin Wargo
City/Town	East Helena
State/Province	MT
Email Address	austinwargo@gmail.com

#### Q2

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

This proposal is spot on. FWP needs to pay attention to areas where elk numbers are dwindling, just as much or if not more than areas where elk are over objective. The NW corner of the state is a disgrace when it comes to elk numbers. the elk population has steadily decreased since the increase in the wolf population. I am not anti wolf and would be happy if there was double the amount of wolves as long as the elk population is healthy and more of the historical numbers. it's sad to see that more elk used to be killed out of nw corner of the the state than the current objective. I feel FWP efforts has been focused on landowner issues with to many elk and other areas have been forgotten and ignored. something needs to change, the NW corner of the state has some of the largest tracks of public and the least amount of elk and other ungulates. something is not right.

## COMPLETE

Link 1 (Web Link)
day, October 04, 2022 8:49:24 PM
day, October 04, 2022 8:53:32 PM
4:07
47.58.133

## Page 1

### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Jimmy Johnson
City/Town	ALBERTON
State/Province	MT
Email Address	gjohns@blackfoot.net
State/Province	МТ

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Current elk may show how few elk there are in areas that used to hold many more.ie 270 and 202, 201, 216....

## COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Wednesday, October 05, 2022 12:17:17 PM
Last Modified:	Wednesday, October 05, 2022 12:19:28 PM
Time Spent:	00:02:11
IP Address:	161.7.94.17

#### Page 1

### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Micheal Hancock
City/Town	Anaconda
State/Province	MT
Email Address	troutslayersmt@yahoo.com

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Start by limiting the OTC tags to nonresidents. Limit the areas nonresident hunters can hunt in by making them choose one hunting district for their Elk hunt.

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Wednesday, October 05, 2022 12:55:41 PM
Last Modified:	Wednesday, October 05, 2022 12:57:17 PM
Time Spent:	00:01:36
IP Address:	216.14.254.86

Page 1

#### Q1

Respondent skipped this question

Contact info (optional)

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

I do not agree with the aerial harvest of wolves to be considered as a legal method of take in elk areas under objective.

As FWP noted in their response, our main concern with elk management in NW Montana is the habitat. We have and continue to encourage FWP and other land management agencies to invest more in habitat improvements, prescribed burning, thinning projects and more.

## COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Friday, October 07, 2022 8:09:42 PM
Last Modified:	Friday, October 07, 2022 8:14:05 PM
Time Spent:	00:04:23
IP Address:	98.97.113.218

### Page 1

### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Greg Povenski
City/Town	Hamilton
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	gjp784@gmail.com

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Agree, move elk off of wealthy, non-resident, landowners property (where they are intentionally keeping them) into areas lacking elk. Then you can stop rewarding these wealthy landowners bad behavior with guaranteed either sex tags and increase opportunity for resident Montana hunters.

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Saturday, October 08, 2022 5:54:40 PM
Last Modified:	Saturday, October 08, 2022 6:08:50 PM
Time Spent:	00:14:09
IP Address:	65.131.204.220

#### Page 1

#### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Larry D Rattray
City/Town	PROCTOR
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	rattpak@centurytel.net

#### Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

The largest challenge is that the elk that are in 120 have moved onto the protected land of landowners who do not allow access to hunters. The reason they went there is 2 fold. One, the winter of 96 -97 caused a lot of the elk to move down to lower elevation and killed off a lot of the elk that lived in the hills. The number of wolves in the hills have help chase them down to the fields that don't allow access and there is no reason for them to leave.

The area has changed since the hayday of elk but there have been large fires which have opened up areas. It is easy to say there is not the habitat but the elk lived in the hills before and they are gone now.

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Monday, October 10, 2022 5:56:50 PM
Last Modified:	Monday, October 10, 2022 6:09:53 PM
Time Spent:	00:13:03
IP Address:	72.175.84.7

#### Page 1

#### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	chris downs
City/Town	kalispell
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	ccdowns100@gmail.com

#### Q2

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

The access issue is not about a few badly behaved hunters. That's a smokescreen for the fact that wildlife is now monetized in Montana. i can think of a handful of large ranches that don't allow any meaningful public hunting. 3 of 4 are leased by outfitters with no interest in seeing public cow hunting on their leases. the department shoukd reach out and sub lease from them to allow cow hunting only in December, after the general season. It's all about money, not hunter behavior. The biggest dis-incentive to allowing public access is giving landowners bull tags without requiring them to allow at least 1 public bull tag good only on their property and a minimum of 10 cow tags for every bull tag they are given. that is the only leverage the department has over large wealthy landowners or outfitters. Follow Utahs program. At least they get something for the public hunter. Or consider using the FWP helicopter to run elk off of private and onto public if landowners say there are too many on their property. Also, the general elk tag shoukd be either sex in any unit that is "over objective". B tags and the associated process and fees only reduce participation and cow harvest. it only makes sense if generating funds is the objective.

#### COMPLETE

Started: Monday, October 10, 2022 7:59:18 PM
Last Modified: Monday, October 10, 2022 8:07:16 PM
Time Spent:         00:07:57
IP Address: 174.215.20.22

### Page 1

### **Q1**

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Jie cote
City/Town	Helena
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	jcote5813@gmail.com

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Great idea. How are you going to control the wolf population from killing everything in that part of the state. Just moving more elk to the area is not the answer. Fix the wolf problem and deer and elk will fix them self.....

## COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Tuesday, October 11, 2022 11:07:12 AM
Last Modified:	Tuesday, October 11, 2022 11:08:08 AM
Time Spent:	00:00:56
IP Address:	128.177.52.83

## Page 1

### **Q1**

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Phil Matteson
City/Town	Cascade
State/Province	MT
Email Address	pkjmatteson@msn.com

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

I agree with managing elk, managing predators and managing habitat. All are major factors in having healthy elk populations.

## COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Tuesday, October 11, 2022 3:18:17 PM
Last Modified:	Tuesday, October 11, 2022 3:19:48 PM
Time Spent:	00:01:30
IP Address:	63.153.100.226

## Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Allen L Farrington
City/Town	Darby
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	0nwal0@gmail.com

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Positive, herd relocations from local herds on private land would address several management issues.

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Wednesday, October 12, 2022 1:07:34 PM
Last Modified:	Wednesday, October 12, 2022 1:12:09 PM
Time Spent:	00:04:35
IP Address:	67.143.192.101

#### Page 1

#### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Bruce D Mikesell
City/Town	Huson
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	bdmikes@yahoo.com

#### Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

As a Montana resident, I urge you to reject recommendations to expand black bear and wolf hunting and trapping in a misguided and unscientific effort to expand elk populations. Agency biologists have already stated that low elk populations in northwest Montana are due to habitat issues, rather than predator populations. We cannot allow the reckless destruction and scapegoating of native predator species. I urge the department to explore habitat restoration as a viable means to increase elk populations in northwest Montana"

Please do not promote the senseless killing of predators which are vital to a healthy, sustainable ecosystem.

Thank you Bruce D. Mikesell, MD

## COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Wednesday, October 12, 2022 1:09:36 PM
Last Modified:	Wednesday, October 12, 2022 1:12:41 PM
Time Spent:	00:03:04
IP Address:	63.153.106.11

#### Page 1

### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Victoria Cavelle Hall
City/Town	hamilton
State/Province	MT
Email Address	victoriachall2@yahoo.com

#### **Q2**

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

I am a Montana resident. I would like you to reject the recommendation to expand black bear and wolf hunting and trapping. It is a misguided approach to expand the elk population. It is a habitat problem not a predictor problem and to fix the problem means to fix the habitat. Please explore habitat restoration as a means to this problem.

## COMPLETE

Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Wednesday, October 12, 2022 1:18:26 PM
Wednesday, October 12, 2022 1:18:55 PM
00:00:29
65.39.120.159

## Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	m h
City/Town	Cardwell
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	rluvpups2@gmail.com

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

GOD created them and we need them.

## COMPLETE

Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Wednesday, October 12, 2022 1:19:16 PM
Wednesday, October 12, 2022 1:20:17 PM
00:01:00
184.167.234.123

## Page 1

## Q1

Contact info	o (optional)
--------------	--------------

Name	Marlene Miller
City/Town	Butte
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	marlenes_mail@yahoo.com

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Wednesday, October 12, 2022 1:08:23 PM
Last Modified:	Wednesday, October 12, 2022 1:21:59 PM
Time Spent:	00:13:36
IP Address:	71.15.215.39

#### Page 1

### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Caroline Byrd
City/Town	Bozeman
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	cbyrd@seabird-strategies.com

#### **Q2**

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Please do not adopt recommendations to increase bear and wolf hunting and trapping in an effort to expand elk populations. This approach will be ineffective in reaching your goal of addressing low elk populations in northwest Montana. The low elk populations in that part of the state are due to habitat issues rather than predation. I urge you to use sound and strategic approaches to elk habitat management and improvements rather than spending time, resources, capacity and funding on reducing predator populations.

### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Wednesday, October 12, 2022 1:40:35 PM
Last Modified:	Wednesday, October 12, 2022 1:47:23 PM
Time Spent:	00:06:48
IP Address:	108.174.115.118

### Page 1

### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	TONI A STARK
City/Town	Stevensville
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	iamironwoman@gmail.com

#### **Q2**

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

I reside in the 3-Mile Area of Stevensville and, not long ago, a neighbor got in trouble for luring elk onto his property. His friends surrounded the herd with their trucks and then slaughtered the entire herd. It was on the PM News and it was a bloody scene. You need to protect elk where they are, not manage them where they are not.

#### COMPLETE

Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Wednesday, October 12, 2022 1:45:55 PM
Wednesday, October 12, 2022 1:48:04 PM
00:02:09
35.150.64.129

#### Page 1

### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Gerry Rhoades
City/Town	Billings
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	gerry@montanapens.com

#### Q2

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

As a Montana resident, I urge you to reject recommendations to expand black bear and wolf hunting and trapping in a misguided and unscientific effort to expand elk populations. Agency biologists have already stated that low elk populations in northwest Montana are due to habitat issues, rather than predator populations. We cannot allow the reckless destruction and scapegoating of native predator species. I urge the department to explore habitat restoration as a viable means to increase elk populations in northwest Montana

### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Wednesday, October 12, 2022 1:53:01 PM
Last Modified:	Wednesday, October 12, 2022 1:56:58 PM
Time Spent:	00:03:56
IP Address:	216.47.51.50

### Page 1

### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Colleen Hinds
City/Town	Heron
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	colleenhinds@hotmail.com

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Reckless speeding drivers & loss of Elk habitat due to sprawl development has more to do with low Elk numbers than the wolves. Where is your science backed studies?? This hope of Wolf Fear is pseudo science & FWP should lead the way with Facts not Fears

#### COMPLETE

eb Link 1 (Web Link)
ednesday, October 12, 2022 1:59:17 PM
ednesday, October 12, 2022 2:07:07 PM
:07:50
.144.133.117

#### Page 1

### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Bill Bridgeland
City/Town	Gardiner
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	bill.bridgeland@gmail.com

#### Q2

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

"As a Montana resident, I urge you to reject recommendations to expand black bear and wolf hunting and trapping in a misguided and unscientific effort to expand elk populations. Agency biologists have already stated that low elk populations in northwest Montana are due to habitat issues, rather than predator populations. We cannot allow the reckless destruction and scapegoating of native predator species. I urge the department to explore habitat restoration as a viable means to increase elk populations in northwest Montana"

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Wednesday, October 12, 2022 2:16:44 PM
Last Modified:	Wednesday, October 12, 2022 2:17:57 PM
Time Spent:	00:01:12
IP Address:	174.198.134.47

#### Page 1

### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Faith Conroy
City/Town	Cameron
State/Province	MT
Email Address	faithconroy@yahoo.com

### Q2

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

As a Montana resident, I urge you to reject recommendations to expand black bear and wolf hunting and trapping in a misguided and unscientific effort to expand elk populations. Agency biologists have already stated that low elk populations in northwest Montana are due to habitat issues, rather than predator populations. We cannot allow the reckless destruction and scapegoating of native predator species. I urge the department to explore habitat restoration as a viable means to increase elk populations in northwest Montana.

### COMPLETE

Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Wednesday, October 12, 2022 2:23:45 PM
Wednesday, October 12, 2022 2:26:04 PM
00:02:19
34.209.46.248

#### Page 1

### **Q1**

Contact info (optional)	
Name	kent I mollohan
City/Town	Helena
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	kentm123@live.com

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Leave the wolves, bears, coyotes and other wild animals alone; let them live. If the farmers and ranchers dislike the elk, let them protect their property without public aid. Enough of the wildlife killing for some bugger's profits.

#### COMPLETE

Started: Wednesday, October 12, 2022 2:12:09 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, October 12, 2022 2:40:20 PM
<b>Time Spent:</b> 00:28:10
IP Address: 216.14.237.40

#### Page 1

#### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Jack Rich
City/Town	Seeley Lake
State/Province	MT
Email Address	richranch@montana.com

#### Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

I strongly support any efforts to address the predator/ungulate issues in and around the Bob Marshall Complex. We own and operate a year-around guest ranch / outfitting business in the Blackfoot/Clearwater and have guided continuously here and in the southwest corner of the Bob Marshall for over 60 years.

I have worked as volunteer with FWP many times over the last 40 years on both big and small game surveys, winter counts, and special studies to better understand the issues affecting healthy, sustainable wildlife populations.

For the last 20 years we have witnessed first-hand the increase in carnivore numbers and the corresponding decline of elk and deer populations. A more effective and comprehensive approach to managing carnivore numbers is desperately needed to restore a healthy balance.

The time for action is NOW!

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Wednesday, October 12, 2022 2:38:55 PM
Last Modified:	Wednesday, October 12, 2022 2:49:21 PM
Time Spent:	00:10:25
IP Address:	98.125.80.243

#### Page 1

### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Mary K(Kathy) Ross
City/Town	bigfork
State/Province	MT
Email Address	mtkat67@gmail.com

#### Q2

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

I have been a Montana resident for over 30 years. I have done years of hands on work as a volunteer with wildlife and birds. Blaming bears and wolves for lower numbers of Elk is unbelievable when it is obviously human activities and loss of habitat that are responsible for any problems with Elk populations. Extending the season on Bears and Wolves is especially absurd considering year round hunting and trapping will cause much larger issues in the environment. Do we never learn from past mistakes? Show you are better than the politics that drive the decisions. Handle these decisions with science and wisdom. Thank you, Kathy Ross

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Wednesday, October 12, 2022 2:49:03 PM
Last Modified:	Wednesday, October 12, 2022 2:49:54 PM
Time Spent:	00:00:50
IP Address:	174.45.90.12

#### Page 1

### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Kaye Grissom
City/Town	Bozeman
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	k.grissom@bresnan.net

#### Q2

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

As a Montana resident, I urge you to reject recommendations to expand black bear and wolf hunting and trapping in a misguided and unscientific effort to expand elk populations. Agency biologists have already stated that low elk populations in northwest Montana are due to habitat issues, rather than predator populations. We cannot allow the reckless destruction and scapegoating of native predator species. I urge the department to explore habitat restoration as a viable means to increase elk populations in northwest Montana

### COMPLETE

Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Wednesday, October 12, 2022 2:56:39 PM
Wednesday, October 12, 2022 3:23:25 PM
00:26:45
72.174.12.204

### Page 1

### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	charles sheroke
City/Town	missoula
State/Province	MT
Email Address	sheroke202@hotmail.com

#### **Q2**

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

predator populations are dependent on prey availability. Your decision to expand hunting, trapping snares and aerial killing opportunities to reduce wolf and bear populations flies in the face of science. Your decision will undoubtly continue the practice of predator slaughter for no scientifically based reason, but only to satisfy political pressures.

#### COMPLETE

Collector: Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started: Wednesday, October 12, 2022 3:43:38 PM
Last Modified: Wednesday, October 12, 2022 3:46:24 PM
<b>Time Spent:</b> 00:02:45
IP Address: 35.150.71.135

#### Page 1

### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Jeff Watkins
City/Town	Missoula
State/Province	MT
Email Address	jeffwatkinsmt@gmail.com

#### **Q2**

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

I support managing elk where they are not. The NW portion of the state has been neglected as far as elk management goes in the recent past. The idea of improving habitat resulting in improved elk populations to reduce travelling of hunters to other parts of the state is one of the best and most refreshing ideas I have heard in a long time. Please make this long term investment in our hunting future.

## COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Wednesday, October 12, 2022 3:59:01 PM
Last Modified:	Wednesday, October 12, 2022 4:01:49 PM
Time Spent:	00:02:48
IP Address:	184.167.187.110

## Page 1

### **Q1**

Contact info (optional)	
Name	John Greever
City/Town	Bozeman
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	marketfish1@gmail.com

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

I am against widespread killing of wolves and bears in Montana.

## COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Wednesday, October 12, 2022 4:07:35 PM
Last Modified:	Wednesday, October 12, 2022 4:08:50 PM
Time Spent:	00:01:15
IP Address:	174.204.12.85
•	

## Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Gail Souther
City/Town	Hamilton
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	gksouther@yahoo.com
Q2	Respondent skipped this question
Please provide comment on the recommendation for We	

Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

## COMPLETE

Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Wednesday, October 12, 2022 4:14:21 PM
Wednesday, October 12, 2022 4:16:48 PM
00:02:27
47.5.3.210

#### Page 1

## Q1

City/Town	Butte
State/Province	МТ

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

As a Montana resident, I urge you to reject recommendations to expand black bear and wolf hunting and trapping in a misguided and unscientific effort to expand elk populations.

Agency biologists have already stated that low elk populations in northwest Montana are due to habitat issues, rather than predator populations.

I urge the department to explore habitat restoration as a viable means to increase elk populations in northwest Montana

## COMPLETE

Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Wednesday, October 12, 2022 4:24:13 PM
Wednesday, October 12, 2022 4:45:52 PM
00:21:39
69.146.110.146

## Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	lan Wargo
City/Town	Kalispell
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	iwargo@rpa-kal.com

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Since wrapping up the CAG I've been racking my brain on how to better portray to the public the unique issues that we face in NW Montana. Having spent a lifetime on the landscape and having witnessed the dramatic changes I feel it's time to take a new approach so hopefully we can see some positive change so we hopefully can turn the Region back into the hunting destination that it once was.

I have been excited to hear that it sounds like the USFS is getting money for fuels reduction which could hopefully create some beneficial habitat that we are in desperate need of. On the other side of the coin I think we need a new approach to the predation issues that we face. Currently the opposition has a very strong argument for reducing predator management if you look at things from a statewide perspective. Montana is over objective on elk and our growing elk populations in the state have caused many management issues that you are well aware of. So, when there are cries to reduce predator populations to increase elk numbers I can see how this comes across poorly to the non-consumptive public. If elk are over objective and we're are saying we need to kill predators to get more elk I think it comes across that we want to kill predators just to wipe them off the face of the earth. Not the case at all.

Montana is a big state and the issues vary drastically from one corner to another. This is where I would like to advocate more support for biologists in the northwest so we can have a better public education campaign. The issue in the northwest is not the number of predators, it's the lack of prey. I am confident that increasing predator management in the northwest is biologically sound, but we need to show that that management decision is sound to the public. That's where I think a new approach is needed

The new approach that I would advocate for would be to monitoring all species populations on the landscape utilizing a common boundary. Historically each species gets its own boundary, so it is hard to see how species interact. Predators get a lot of heat in northwest MT but why? It's not the number of predators that's the issue it's the lack of ungulates. Therefore, if a decision was made to increase the take on predators it could be shown that it was due to the lack of ungulates, not just for the sake of killing predators. Public perception in predator management is one of the biggest considerations, and it would be far better received by the public if you were able to show the numbers for each species. With population counts for all species, healthy predator to prey ratios could be set and managed towards instead of managing towards numerical benchmarks. Because at a certain point you cant expect to grow your predator populations if they don't have a food source.

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Wednesday, October 12, 2022 4:57:15 PM
Last Modified:	Wednesday, October 12, 2022 4:57:27 PM
Time Spent:	00:00:11
IP Address:	65.131.192.49

#### Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Kathy L Shogren
City/Town	COLUMBIA FLS
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	roseyaire@aol.com

## **Q2**

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

"As a Montana resident, I urge you to reject recommendations to expand black bear and wolf hunting and trapping in a misguided and unscientific effort to expand elk populations. Agency biologists have already stated that low elk populations in northwest Montana are due to habitat issues, rather than predator populations. We cannot allow the reckless destruction and scapegoating of native predator species. I urge the department to explore habitat restoration as a viable means to increase elk populations in northwest Montana"

## COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Wednesday, October 12, 2022 5:26:29 PM
Last Modified:	Wednesday, October 12, 2022 5:32:39 PM
Time Spent:	00:06:10
IP Address:	172.221.119.226

## Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Renelle Braaten
City/Town	Havre
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	renelle.braaten@enell.com

## **Q2**

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

I do not see any reason what so ever to "manage elk" by killing more bears and wolves. The only management we need in this situation is to manage the people pushing this ridiculous solution. I will listen to Mother Nature WAY before these humans. Mother Nature doesn't need us, we need Mother Nature!

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Wednesday, October 12, 2022 5:36:48 PM
Last Modified:	Wednesday, October 12, 2022 5:42:29 PM
Time Spent:	00:05:40
IP Address:	216.14.236.18

#### Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Ron Torretta
City/Town	Trout Creek
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	rontorretta@hotmail.cm

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

We need sustainable populations of grizzly bears and wolves in Montana.

As a Montana resident, I urge you to reject recommendations to expand black bear and wolf hunting and trapping in a misguided and unscientific effort to expand elk populations. Agency biologists have already stated that low elk populations in northwest Montana are due to habitat issues, rather than predator populations. We cannot allow the reckless destruction and scapegoating of native predator species. I urge the department to explore habitat restoration as a viable means to increase elk populations in northwest Montana.

Besides, many elk populations in northwest Montana are already at population objectives as is so there is even less of an argument for reducing predators such as bears and wolves.

## COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Wednesday, October 12, 2022 6:01:42 PM
Last Modified:	Wednesday, October 12, 2022 6:04:18 PM
Time Spent:	00:02:36
IP Address:	184.166.99.235
Time Spent:	00:02:36

## Page 1

## Q1

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We	
Q2	Respondent skipped this question
Email Address	dunkum@bresnan.net
State/Province	МТ
City/Town	Missoula
Name	john e dunkum
Contact info (optional)	

Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

#### COMPLETE

Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Wednesday, October 12, 2022 7:57:37 PM
Wednesday, October 12, 2022 8:12:57 PM
00:15:20
35.133.10.20

## Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	linda olson
City/Town	Polson
State/Province	MT
Email Address	olsongraphix@yahoo.com

## **Q2**

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Hello,

As a Montana resident I urge you to reject recommendations to expand Bear and Wolf hunting and trapping. Stop the reckless and destructive scapegoating of our native predator species.

Elk populations are due to habitat issues...not the predator population. Wolves are bears are an important part of our ecosystem and belong in Montana.

Sincerely, Linda Olson

## COMPLETE

Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Thursday, October 13, 2022 7:50:46 AM
Thursday, October 13, 2022 7:51:04 AM
00:00:17
97.121.212.243

## Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Rick Miller
City/Town	Colstrip
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	grrizzz@q.com

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

I support this recommendation

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Thursday, October 13, 2022 8:22:37 AM
Last Modified:	Thursday, October 13, 2022 8:37:01 AM
Time Spent:	00:14:24
IP Address:	184.166.179.48

#### Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Sarah Yerkes
City/Town	KALISPELL
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	seyerkes@gmail.com

## Q2

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

As a hunter in NW Montana I 100% agree with this. Having a year round wolf season is a good start or better yet having them like coyotes with no tag requirement. There is also the discussion of grizzly bears that need to be managed as well, there is a definite need for a season for them. I realize this is a very complex issue and not all of the public understands predator management, that being said they still need managed in order to save out ungulate herds. More access for winter usage is a great idea. I am unsure about signage as I do believe that some anti-trapping groups will use that to their benefit unfortunately. Reasonable forest management and accessibility is something that needs addressed.

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Thursday, October 13, 2022 11:09:49 AM
Last Modified:	Thursday, October 13, 2022 11:12:42 AM
Time Spent:	00:02:53
IP Address:	97.121.253.124
Time Spent:	00:02:53

## Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Gail and John Richardson
City/Town	Bozeman
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	envirogail@q.com

## **Q2**

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Manage habitat by enhancing it for elk in NW MT. Do not use elk as an excuse to decimate our imperiled carnivore populations by using the most egregious methods imaginable. Elk statewide are way beyond expectations. NW MT needs help with enhancing habitat for elk not destruction of our precious wildlife heritage by those who only see wildlife as money.

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Thursday, October 13, 2022 11:28:07 AM
Last Modified:	Thursday, October 13, 2022 11:28:36 AM
Time Spent:	00:00:29
IP Address:	206.163.246.10
Last Modified: Time Spent:	Thursday, October 13, 2022 11:28:36 AM 00:00:29

#### Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Tamm Zaryski
City/Town	Plentywood
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	zcar@sasktel.net

## **Q2**

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

As a Montana resident, I urge you to reject recommendations to expand black bear and wolf hunting and trapping in a misguided and unscientific effort to expand elk populations. Agency biologists have already stated that low elk populations in northwest Montana are due to habitat issues, rather than predator populations. We cannot allow the reckless destruction and scapegoating of native predator species. I urge the department to explore habitat restoration as a viable means to increase elk populations in northwest Montana"

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Thursday, October 13, 2022 11:40:13 AM
Last Modified:	Thursday, October 13, 2022 11:48:25 AM
Time Spent:	00:08:11
IP Address:	162.217.224.45

#### Page 1

#### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Paul M. Grove
City/Town	Eureka
State/Province	MT
Email Address	bludatta@yahoo.com

## Q2

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

I am a hunter living in NW Montana and I reject any proposition to increase predator hunting in my state. If we want more elk, we need to limit the relentless sprawl of our urban areas and work to restore all the incredible habitat we still have in our great state.

Montana is not a giant elk farm; we need healthy, functioning ecosystems which depend on a robust predator system to keep them healthy. The data is there, our scientists and biologists have clearly stated that it is the mitigation of habitat loss, NOT predator control, that will allow more elk to thrive here.

Stop the relentless assault on our wildlife and ecosystems, DO NOT allow more predator hunting in Montana.

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Thursday, October 13, 2022 12:02:21 PM
Last Modified:	Thursday, October 13, 2022 12:03:46 PM
Time Spent:	00:01:25
IP Address:	98.97.112.14

#### Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Indie
City/Town	Eureka
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	indigo@nature.camp

## Q2

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

As a Montana resident, I urge you to reject recommendations to expand black bear, wolf hunting and trapping in a misguided and unscientific effort to expand elk populations. Agency biologists have already stated that low elk populations in northwest Montana are due to habitat issues, rather than predator populations. We cannot allow the reckless destruction and scapegoating of native predator species. I urge the department to explore habitat restoration as a viable means to increase elk populations in northwest Montana-science has shown us that the Elk populations thrive with more predator activity... see the Yellowstone study. Thank you

## COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Thursday, October 13, 2022 1:29:59 PM
Last Modified:	Thursday, October 13, 2022 1:30:26 PM
Time Spent:	00:00:26
IP Address:	63.153.100.226
Last Modified: Time Spent:	Thursday, October 13, 2022 1:30:26 PM 00:00:26

## Page 1

## Q1

Bonnie and Allen Farrington
Darby
МТ
bcfarrington@gmail.com

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Sounds good.

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Thursday, October 13, 2022 1:35:50 PM
Last Modified:	Thursday, October 13, 2022 1:53:12 PM
Time Spent:	00:17:22
IP Address:	174.231.87.117

#### Page 1

#### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Justin Goodsell
City/Town	Columbia Falls
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	jjgoodsell@yahoo.com

## Q2

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

This is spot on. We need to do more to restore deer and elk populations to what they used to be. Or at least try to get the numbers back up. Ian has some great ideas i hope people will look at. There are minimum population numbers for predators why can't we do the same for elk. Northwest Montana used to be some of the best hunting in the country. Now alot of people that grew up in the area travel to hunt or have quit hunting altogether. Everyone thinks that all hunters hate wolves but I think most of us appreciate what a cool animal they are. However they seemed to be the tipping point with our Ungulate population around here. Also the grizzlies have gotten out of control. This year during spring bear season I saw more grizzlies than I did black bears. That should not be. I realize this isn't in your direct control but the black bears are taking a beating now because grizzlies can't be hunted. 15+ years ago the amount of game you would see in the wintering ranges was 5 to 10 fold what it is today. Between teakettle mountain and the Middlefork wintering ranges alone we would see 30 + bulls. Now you can't hardly find one. And the habitat has not changed much in those areas. I am in 100 percent agreement with ideas we can come up with to help our elk populations in Region 1 even if it means changing and limiting our hunting opportunities. I always say to my friends that they shouldn't even let people hunt deer and elk in the south fork because they should be on the endangered species list. Thanks for your efforts. I hope we can get somewhere with this.

## COMPLETE

1 (Web Link)
October 13, 2022 2:35:21 PM
October 13, 2022 2:35:56 PM
5.57

## Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Jocelyn Leroux
City/Town	MISSOULA
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	jocelyn@westernwatersheds.org

#### Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Dear Commissioners,

Please accept these comments on behalf of Western Watersheds Project, WildEarth Guardians, and the Sierra Club. While we agree that it is vital to address elk management in the state and that varied perspectives are important, we are greatly concerned about recommendation number 11, "We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not." We appreciate the FWP staff assessment of this recommendation; it does a good job of pointing out the flaws of relying on predator and timber management to enhance and protect elk populations.

The recommendation takes a narrow look at the factors that influence elk populations and zeroes in on an unfounded and controversial method for enhancing the elk population. The emphasis on predator management, particularly wolf population reduction, seems to be fueled by ill-informed public statements that the wolf population is destroying the elk population. However, without any scientific evidence to support this claim, FWP cannot condone extreme measures to reduce the wolf population in Northwest Montana. As FWP staff noted in their assessment, a study is currently underway to understand the interactions between predators and their ungulate prey. Until this understanding is reached, it would be irresponsible to increase wolf killing.

Of particular concern in the recommendation, is the suggestion that wolf hunting be allowed year-round in areas where the predator-toprey ratio is "out of balance." Predators and prey have existed on the landscape for millions of years and do so in a synergistic manner. If there was not enough food for the predators, they would not be as abundant; in this way, nature regulates itself. Additionally, opening up wolf hunting year-round with the already increasingly liberalized hunting and trapping rules would be even more likely to lead to an unsustainable drop in wolf populations that might lead to federal listing of the species. The Supplemental Information provided notes that the consequences of further reducing the state's wolf population are not something to be "feared" because the wolf recovery thus far has been a success, showing their "ability to quickly rebound and recover." Wolf recovery in the lower-48 states, however, has been anything but quick and easy. Even after several decades of recovery efforts under the Endangered Species Act and an estimated \$160 million, wolves are still not fully recovered. Wolf recovery is cost, labor, and time intensive, and further reducing wolf populations under this recommendation should be rejected. Also as noted by staff, "carnivores are likely to repopulate the area quickly from surrounding areas." The habitat in Northwest Montana is excellent for wolves and other carnivores, and if the population were reduced enough for them not to repopulate following hunting, there would be serious concerns about the viability of the population in Montana.

The recommendation also suggests opening closed roads to hunters and trappers so that they can more successfully target predators in deer and elk winter range. This would likely have a larger negative impact on wintering deer and elk than predators do and would be incredibly difficult to carry out in a responsible manner. This should absolutely not be considered.

Among other things, this recommendation fails to consider confounding factors that would lead to a decrease in elk population numbers in Northwest Montana. While it is true that there is a high concentration of public lands in this part of the state, public lands do not necessarily mean good and productive elk habitat. Areas where elk are consistently over objective, and where they are not wanted contain open lands where there is less hunting pressure and a lot of food. This cannot be attributed only to predators and therefore cannot be solved through predator management. FWP staff correctly point out that, "[w]hile elk numbers were historically higher in NW Montana, that was when there was significantly more open canopy and earlier succession resulting from intensive logging and fire." While large fires may naturally occur again and there are some prescribed burn projects that are proceeding, the amount of logging that led to these habitat conditions cannot responsibly occur again due to the impact on various aspects of the ecosystem.

Northwest Montana contains heavily timbered land that has seen a decrease in logging which can limit elk distribution. Recognizing this is to recognize that previously reported high elk numbers may not be a desirable outcome. FWP staff has recognized this in their response when they say that,

"[t]he habitat to support elk numbers from the 'good old days' is no longer available and likely won't be given the social, legal, and ecological constraints on forest management. The situation observed in the early days is not likely to happen again and in effect

#### Recommendation #11: We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not

created a 'boom and bust' scenario. Even in the 1960s there was concern that elk numbers were too high creating habitat damage."

This kind of nuanced understanding of what drives population numbers is key to ensuring balanced wildlife management. Further, a large and growing body of science demonstrates that robust wolf populations positively affect the ecosystems where they are present. Wolf predation of ungulates like elk influences their movement and distribution, decreasing impacts that ungulate browsing has on trees, bushes, and grasses, and keeps these prey species moving throughout the landscape. Additionally, "historical data" of elk population numbers from the decades between 1920 and 1950 is inapplicable today because that time period was the tail end of decades of government-led wolf extermination. By the 1950's, government-sponsored wolf eradication efforts led to a near complete absence of wolves from the lower-48 states, with wolves remaining only in Minnesota and Michigan. Therefore, elk population numbers in Montana between 1920-1950 when there were no wolves present were not the result of a healthy, balanced ecosystem that included wolves.

Overall, it appears that this recommendation does not consider the entire ecological picture that is likely driving elk population changes in Northwest Montana, and unreasonably targets predators. The supplemental information asks for "focused efforts by the department" to allow "healthier populations of ALL wildlife," with which we heartily agree. Predators cannot be unnecessarily targeted solely to benefit ungulates. FWP staff have responded thoughtfully regarding these challenges while noting that this recommendation is likely not feasible. We strongly recommend not implementing any aspects of this recommendation as it would only serve to increase antipredator bias without improving elk population numbers in Northwest Montana.

Thank you for your time and consideration.

Sincerely,

Jocelyn Leroux, Western Watersheds Project, jocelyn@westernwatersheds.org Lizzy Pennock, Wild Earth Guardians, Ipennock@wildearthguardians.org Bonnie Rice, Sierra Club, bonnie.rice@sierraclub.org

## COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Thursday, October 13, 2022 3:24:39 PM
Last Modified:	Thursday, October 13, 2022 3:25:39 PM
Time Spent:	00:01:00
IP Address:	47.158.164.70

## Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Vincent DePinto
City/Town	Indio
State/Province	CA
Email Address	vinnyd1104@aol.com

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Unaware what that means.

## COMPLETE

_ink 1 (Web Link)
day, October 13, 2022 3:46:33 PM
day, October 13, 2022 3:57:50 PM
:16
4.236.106

## Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Timm vogelsberg
City/Town	Alberton
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	timm@mso.umt.edu

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

I urge you to reject any calls to kill more bears or wolves. They are part of the eco-system and necessary for the system to function well! Killing bears and wolves does not recognize Montana's heritage.

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Thursday, October 13, 2022 4:33:37 PM
Last Modified:	Thursday, October 13, 2022 4:34:34 PM
Time Spent:	00:00:56
IP Address:	69.146.1.253

#### Page 1

#### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Montana Citizens Elk Management Coalition
City/Town	Helena
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	mstrange@mtwf.org

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

The issue of elk populations in places like Region 1 are

complex and difficult to pinpoint. We are in support of finding ways to bring elk back to historic levels seen after the Great Burn. We would note that the agency is currently set to engage in a study relative to elk distribution, habitat quality and other issues related to this issue, and with the increase of lion quotas in some areas by 30% as well as a relaxation of wolf hunting, we urge the agency to exercise prudence and caution moving too far too fast without the proper understanding of what exactly is driving elk to select the habitats they currently do, as well as understand the issues and challenges that public land habitat is facing relative to elk distribution. We also would note that the season setting process will begin again in earnest in 2023, which represents an opportunity to make thoughtful changes in districts where elk distribution is well known in order to better ensure hunter success and proper management of elk.

## COMPLETE

Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Thursday, October 13, 2022 4:43:57 PM
Thursday, October 13, 2022 4:46:09 PM
00:02:11
216.14.242.73

## Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Steve Kamps
City/Town	Ovando
State/Province	MT
Email Address	12kamps@gmail.com

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Very good proposal that is way behind its time. Its obvious predation and wolves have caused the steep declines and need to be managed much, much more aggressively.

## COMPLETE

Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Thursday, October 13, 2022 7:47:09 PM
Thursday, October 13, 2022 7:49:46 PM
00:02:36
65.131.195.152

## Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Jake Sweeney
City/Town	Columbia Falls
State/Province	MT
Email Address	jakesweeney24@icloud.com

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

I fully support the proposed plan. Trappers need more opportunities to trap wolves along the wintering ranges to protect ungulate.

## COMPLETE

## Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Lon R Reukauf
City/Town	Terry
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	lonreukauf@gmail.com

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

More strategic cattle and sheep grazing on Spotted Dog WMA would encourage elk to spend more time here if grass was not overgrown, coarse and decadent. There are several WMA's where this management has been successful.

## COMPLETE

Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Thursday, October 13, 2022 8:33:47 PM
Thursday, October 13, 2022 8:35:00 PM
00:01:13
174.231.83.133

## Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Craig Savage
City/Town	COLUMBIA FALLS
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	sledenfreak@gmail.com

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Its embarrassing how horribly the elk have been managed in the northwest. Need to kill more wolves and bears.

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Thursday, October 13, 2022 9:01:47 PM
Last Modified:	Thursday, October 13, 2022 9:09:45 PM
Time Spent:	00:07:57
IP Address:	184.166.72.63

Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)

State/Province

Email Address

MT hkmink@yahoo.com

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Habitat loss poses the greatest threat to species. We need to look at how this effects are wild life. Killing off one wildlife to think you can increase another is wrong. People have the biggest effect of our environment. As removing wild horses just to increase grazing land for cattle.

Stop the killing of wildlife that does not solve the problem.

#### COMPLETE

Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Thursday, October 13, 2022 9:07:41 PM
Thursday, October 13, 2022 9:17:59 PM
00:10:17
38.141.44.4

#### Page 1

#### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Cecelia Clapham
City/Town	Stevensville
State/Province	MT
Email Address	cecelia.clapham@gmail.com

## Q2

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

I think the FWP staff assessment pretty well summarizes my own thoughts about this proposal. It is difficult to assess how best to manage both the elk population and predator populations when it is also much harder to collect data from a truly wild place. I think assuming the reduced elk is due to increased predation and immediately jumping to increased predator harvests isn't wise, even if the intent is for it to only be a temporary measure. Nature goes through natural cycles of population growth and decline based on how much the habitat can support and if there are truly too many predators it will correct itself without humans "fixing it", just like it did before we were here. Our hunting of both predators and prey needs to be based on evaluating what is healthy and sustainable and I'm sure FWP biologist and their partners are just as eager to get accurate and recent data. And no, we don't need to open up more roads to motorized vehicles.

## COMPLETE

Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Thursday, October 13, 2022 9:36:51 PM
Thursday, October 13, 2022 9:39:52 PM
00:03:00
66.109.153.84

## Page 1

## **Q1**

Contact info (optional)	
Name	LEREE HENSEN
City/Town	Philipsburg
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	royaltine@gmail.com

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

I like the suggestions put forth in potential management of elk where they are not. I am in support of implementing the vast majority of the ideas.

#### COMPLETE

 Collector:
 Web Link 1 (Web Link)

 Started:
 Friday, October 14, 2022 4:05:12 AM

 Last Modified:
 Friday, October 14, 2022 4:22:31 AM

 Time Spent:
 00:17:18

 IP Address:
 184.167.208.133

Page 1

#### Q1

Respondent skipped this question

Contact info (optional)

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

As a Montana resident, I urge you to reject recommendations to expand black bear and wolf hunting and trapping in a misguided and unscientific effort to expand elk populations. Agency biologists have already stated that low elk populations in northwest Montana are due to habitat issues, rather than predator populations. We cannot allow the reckless destruction and scapegoating of native predator species. I urge the department to explore habitat restoration as a viable means to increase elk populations in northwest Montana. People are the problem when they build in elk habitat and then change the land to suit them and not elk. Put in place rules on what people can and can't do so that the damage they do to elk habitat will be minimized.

## COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Friday, October 14, 2022 9:32:07 AM
Last Modified:	Friday, October 14, 2022 9:37:56 AM
Time Spent:	00:05:49
IP Address:	67.143.208.144

## Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Vicki Faeo
City/Town	Belfry
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	dogknows2000@yahoo.com

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Habitat health and continuity is key to the success and health of all wildlife in adjacent and distant areas and habitat must also be preserved for the health of the human biosphere which is interconnected and linked to wildlife habitat.

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Friday, October 14, 2022 10:34:30 AM
Last Modified:	Friday, October 14, 2022 10:35:37 AM
Time Spent:	00:01:06
IP Address:	69.146.225.203

#### Page 1

#### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Rocky Mountain Elk Foundation
City/Town	Missoula
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	kdecker@rmef.org

## Q2

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

The Rocky Mountain Elk Foundation's (RMEF) mission is to ensure the future of elk, other wildlife, their habitat and our hunting heritage. We represent more than 225,000 members nationwide and over 14,000 members in Montana. Since its inception in 1984, RMEF has permanently conserved or enhanced more than 8.5 million acres of North America's most vital habitat for elk and other wildlife, including over 900,000 acres in Montana. As such, RMEF has a vested interest in ensuring the sustained productivity of elk and other wildlife in Montana.

RMEF supports additional research and tools to manage elk in areas where they are declining or under objective. Northwest Montana is an area that has seen changes in elk distribution, loss of quality habitat, and increased predator populations. RMEF recommends a focused effort with U.S. Forest Service and other public land managers to restore habitat, create more early-seral conditions, and improve forage. RMEF is supportive of FWPs restored research effort in the northwest to better understand the role that forage treatments and predators play in elk population distribution and abundance.

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)	
Started:	Friday, October 14, 2022 11:05:15 AM	
Last Modified:	Friday, October 14, 2022 11:21:21 AM	
Time Spent:	00:16:05	
IP Address:	209.206.245.10	

#### Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Garth Bergman
City/Town	kalispell
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	hcrossing2@gmail.com

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Habitat needs to be looked at. When all the bottom lands have homes where do the elk go to reproduce. We need better habitat to allow numbers to grow especially in region 1.

1. Elk counts are not current. Some are from 2008 and 2009. Need to do an accurate count.

2. Objectives need to be set with regards to capacity and not game counts.

3. Aerial harvest should continue to be illegal.

4. Predator to Elk numbers need to be looked at. If elk were able to survive hundreds of years ago when there were predators around but can't today perhaps the habitat and people moving into calving grounds needs to be looked at. While I agree wolves and mountain lions do eat a lot of elk, before we decided to eradicate the predators, the elk did just fine. It only after we encroached and put up fences and turned meadows into farm fields that numbers started dropping.

5. Black bear seasons should be longer in Region 1 to match other regions.

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Friday, October 14, 2022 11:38:39 AM
Last Modified:	Friday, October 14, 2022 11:40:20 AM
Time Spent:	00:01:40
IP Address:	161.7.39.7
Time Spent:	00:01:40

## Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Bret Lian
City/Town	Jefferson City
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	bret.lian@gmail.com

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

There are hunting districts in NW Montana, open to general elk hunting, where the harvest rate is 1 elk per 400+ hunter days! That is insane. The amount of elk that come out of NW Montana relative to its geographic size is abysmal. I support this effort, though want decisions to be informed by science.

## COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Friday, October 14, 2022 11:37:56 AM
Last Modified:	Friday, October 14, 2022 11:43:15 AM
Time Spent:	00:05:19
IP Address:	172.58.85.102

## Page 1

## Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Eric Clewis
City/Town	Helena
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	eclewis@defenders.org

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

October 14, 2022

Re: Elk Management Citizen Advisory Group Recommendation 11

Dear Montana Fish, Wildlife & Parks:

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on Elk Management Citizen Advisory Group Recommendation 11. Defenders of Wildlife (Defenders) is a national non-profit conservation organization with 9,300 members and supporters in Montana and more than 2.1 million nationwide. Over the last three decades, Defenders has played an important role in the restoration of wolves in the Northern Rockies. This work included our long-running livestock loss compensation program and our ongoing conflict reduction program. We transitioned our compensation program with a \$100,000 start-up fund to the Montana Livestock Loss Board in 2008 and continue to assist livestock producers in Montana and across the West with conflict reduction tools and techniques to minimize losses to wolves and other predators. We operate these projects in partnership with county, state, tribal and federal agencies.

Defenders remains an invested stakeholder in wolf recovery and management across the U.S. and Montana. Recent legislative efforts to drastically reduce the wolf population along with a false narrative that wolves are responsible for the decline in elk populations in Montana Fish, Wildlife & Parks (FWP) region 1 (northwest Montana) are particularly concerning to us. While we understand the need to address the recent decline in elk populations in region 1, the best available science does not point to predators as the primary cause. Scapegoating of predator populations will not increase elk populations. Solutions grounded in science and fact are needed.

Defenders supports efforts to restore elk populations through habitat enhancement as well as expanded elk counting efforts in region 1. We strongly oppose increased predator hunting and trapping in region 1 (specifically year-round hunting of wolves, aerial gunning, and expanded black bear hunting regulations). Our detailed comments regarding various aspects on recommendation 11 are as follows.

"Habitat enhancement projects must become a priority of the department to restore elk populations below objective."

Under the wildlife division's staff assessment of this recommendation, habitat is widely cited as a major issue affecting elk populations in northwest Montana. Habitat succession due to wildfire suppression and a reduction in logging have resulted in dense, heavily vegetated, forests that are not supportive of large elk populations. FWP staff note that habitat enhancement projects, prescribed fire, and selective logging projects show promising potential to increase elk populations while also restoring some degree of economic viability to rural towns within the region. The "boom and bust" scenario that typified elk populations in the 1960's is unlikely to be repeated as elk populations at that time were probably too high, according to FWP.

"The department must conduct current elk counts in Region 1. The Montana 2021 Elk Counts available on the FWP website for Region 1 do not contain any elk counts from 2021. The numbers reported are at least from 2019 and in two districts 100 & 124 the department is reporting numbers from 2009 and 2008 respectively."

While Defenders agrees that FWP must conduct current counts to assess the true population status of elk in the region, FWP biologists have repeatedly noted that aerial counts, the dominant survey method used by FWP, are inadequate considering the dense canopy cover found in northwest Montana. FWP should reassess its methods for estimating the elk population to ensure that aerial surveys are not merely underestimating the current population. Our neighbors in Idaho utilize a remote camera survey system that may be adequate in region 1 given the similarities in terrain and canopy cover between northwest Montana and much of Idaho. Various camera survey methods have already been developed for elk population estimates and could be adapted to fit the unique circumstances in this region (Moeller et al., 2018).

"Aerial harvest of wolves needs to be considered as a legal method of take in elk areas under objective."

#### 109 / 122

#### Recommendation #11: We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not

Aerial shooting of wolves should not be considered under any circumstance. The notion that aerial shooting is an effective strategy that can be employed by the general hunting public is illegal under federal statute (Airborne Hunting Act, 1971), extremely dangerous, and unethical. This form of intensive management is completely out of place on public lands for a native wildlife species.

"The USFS should be petitioned by FWP to open roads to motorized travel by trappers on road segments that were closed during the winter to protect deer and elk winter range (Note: these road closures were originally established under the direction of FWP to protect winter range, but now it is having the opposite effect)."

Opening closed roads to motorized use in the winter could have a negative impact on species including wolverine, lynx, and denning grizzly bears. Any opening of such roads should require significant analysis by the U.S. Forest Service to determine what impacts native wildlife species might incur. We ask that the department reject this suggestion.

"Hunting of wolves year-round should be considered for areas where the predator to ungulate ratios are out of balance or elk are below objective. Extending Black Bear Season to June 15th in Regions 1 and 2."

Hunting of wolves year-round and extending the black bear season to June 15th in Regions 1 and 2 increases the risk of incidental take of grizzly bears as well as potentially dangerous interactions between grizzly bears and hunters in Montana. Additional concerns of an extended black bear season are an increase in orphaned cubs and stressing females with nursing young.

Additionally, year-round hunting of wolves presents threats to recreationists on the landscape. Public lands in summer months are typically highly used by hikers, campers, mountain bikers, and equestrian users who, often, are accompanied by their pets. Introducing year-round hunting of wolves will increase the chances that people and their pets will experience conflict with wolf hunters on the landscape.

Finally, we question the legitimacy of suggesting year-round harvest in areas where the predator-prey ratios are supposedly unbalanced when the elk population estimates are also considered inaccurate. The inadequacy of aerial surveying in region 1 means there is substantial likelihood that the elk population is being underestimated thereby skewing the predator-prey ratio. Also, the complexities of predator-prey interactions cannot be summed up by solely managing the predator-prey ratio of a given region (Bowyer et el., 2013).

"The Department should research and explore if black bear hunting with hounds can be expanded particularly in northwest Montana." Northwest Montana is home to the Cabinet-Yaak grizzly bear population. This population is small and not genetically connected to other populations resulting in low genetic diversity. The U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service's (USFWS) 2021 biological report for the grizzly bear in the Lower-48 States notes that the resiliency of this population is low (the lowest of the four occupied grizzly bear populations) and this condition could further deteriorate if conservation efforts decrease (p. 18, Table 3, USFWS 2021).

Expanding hound hunting and a chase season for black bears in NW Montana may increase the risk of take of grizzly bears and degrade the conservation efforts in place to recover the Cabinet-Yaak population as well as negatively impact connectivity between the Cabinet-Yaak and the NCDE and between the NCDE, Cabinet-Yaak and Bitterroot ecosystem. This is also another recommendation in #11 that may result in dangerous interactions between hunters, dogs, and grizzly bears.

Grizzly bears remain a federally listed species. It is important to note that hound hunting could lead to harassment and/or harm of grizzly bears, particularly in occupied grizzly bear habitat. This could be considered "take" as defined by the ESA. Defenders adamantly opposes hound hunting in occupied grizzly bear habitat and in areas where grizzly bears may be present. We ask Montana Fish, Wildlife and Parks and the Commission to reject the recommendation to explore or move forward with hound hunting of black bears Northwest Montana.

"FWP needs to devote additional resources to create a clear roadmap towards ensuring wolves are not relisted and grizzlies can be delisted."

Recommendations like most of those discussed above are steps backwards and disregard the decades of conservation work put into grizzly bear and wolf recovery. Implementation of these recommendations would do the opposite of creating a "roadmap to grizzly bear delisting" and "ensuring wolves are not relisted" as noted in recommendation #11. If acted upon, these recommendations would create

110 / 122

#### Recommendation #11: We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not

additional hurdles to grizzly bear delisting and additional support for wolf relisting because they would show Montana's lack of adequate regulatory mechanisms to protect the grizzly bear and wolf populations. Please consider the recommendations regarding habitat enhancement and elk surveys and please do not implement the unscientific and ineffective recommendations regarding additional hunting and trapping of predators.

Thank you for your consideration of these comments.

Sincerely,

Eric Clewis Senior Representative, Rockies and Plains Program Defenders of Wildlife eclewis@defenders.org

Citations:

Airborne Hunting Act, 16 U.S.C. § 742j-I (1971). https://www.ecfr.gov/current/title-50/chapter-I/subchapter-B/part-19

Bowyer, R. T., Kie, J. G., Person, D. K., & Monteith, K. L. (2013, February 10). Metrics of predation: perils of predator-prey ratios. Acta Theriologica, 58(4), 329–340. https://doi.org/10.1007/s13364-013-0133-1

Moeller, A. K., Lukacs, P. M., and Horne, J. S.. 2018. Three novel methods to estimate abundance of unmarked animals using remote cameras. Ecosphere 9(8):e02331. 10.1002/ecs2.2331

U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service. 2021. Biological report for the grizzly bear (Ursus arctos horribilis) in the Lower-48 States. Version 1.1, January 31, 2021. Missoula, Montana. 370 pp.

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Friday, October 14, 2022 1:11:48 PM
Last Modified:	Friday, October 14, 2022 1:18:17 PM
Time Spent:	00:06:28
IP Address:	161.7.95.97

#### Page 1

# Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Brian Robbins
City/Town	Anaconda
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	canyousayelk@gmail.com

## Q2

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

I agree. As a native Montanan with 40+ years of hunting, it is absolutely disgusting what elk management has become in Montana. To think of the vast acreage in Montana that is essentially void of elk is a shame. Predator numbers are too high and I think reducing predator numbers could benefit elk and mule deer. How much revenue do Montana Deer and Elk hunters bring in versus Lion, Bear and Wolf hunters? If being honest, it's time to put Deer and Elk first.

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Friday, October 14, 2022 1:51:29 PM
Last Modified:	Friday, October 14, 2022 1:53:32 PM
Time Spent:	00:02:03
IP Address:	98.97.40.214

# Page 1

# Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Kim Lockwood
City/Town	Bozeman
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	klock29118@aol.com

## Q2

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

As a Montana resident I urge you to reject the proposition to kill more predators in order to increase of populations. This is misinformed scientist have already stated that load of populations are due to habitat, not predators. I urge you to explore habitat restoration in order to benefit the other populations in north western Montana, and not pursue the misguided approach to kill native predator species.

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Friday, October 14, 2022 1:51:41 PM
Last Modified:	Friday, October 14, 2022 1:55:26 PM
Time Spent:	00:03:44
IP Address:	206.130.143.109

## Page 1

# Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Adam Neff
City/Town	Cashmere
State/Province	WA
Email Address	neffa3@gmail.com

## Q2

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

I support the intent but not all of the listed recommendations. Opening roads that were closed to help deer and elk isn't going to help create more deer and elk. Killing wolves may have a minor effect, but plenty of places have high wolf #s and still have great deer and elk hunting. NW region needs better habitat and the elk that are there need to not die from acute lead poisoning.

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Friday, October 14, 2022 3:19:41 PM
Last Modified:	Friday, October 14, 2022 3:20:29 PM
Time Spent:	00:00:48
IP Address:	71.15.216.88

# Page 1

# Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Marcus Strange
City/Town	Helena
State/Province	MT
Email Address	mstrange@mtwf.org

## Q2

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

MWF supports the habitat restoration portions only. We also support a new FWP study on habitat conditions, elk distribution, and predation. The predation aspect ignores all of the ongoing efforts to reduce lion, wolf, and to a certain extent, black bear populations in R1, and given the habitat needs in R1, focusing on predation is a poor idea that ignores and scapegoats the real issues.

# COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Friday, October 14, 2022 3:57:29 PM
Last Modified:	Friday, October 14, 2022 4:00:48 PM
Time Spent:	00:03:19
IP Address:	72.250.140.242

# Page 1

# Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Paul Ellis
City/Town	Bozeman
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	ellispaul4@aol.com

# Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

The FWP need to start establishing regulations that better fit a HD. Example why do we have a general season where elk numbers are below objective and have limited permits in HDs that are way over objective.

### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Friday, October 14, 2022 4:33:57 PM
Last Modified:	Friday, October 14, 2022 4:36:59 PM
Time Spent:	00:03:02
IP Address:	107.77.196.20

#### Page 1

### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Bobby
City/Town	Eureka
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	bobby.rae.vick@gmail.com

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

I agree with a lot of this recommendation. Elk have moved to different areas to escape pressure from multiple predators, hunters included.

Better management of wolves would be a great a help, along with limiting out of state tags. Last year FWP gave out more than 50,000 nonresident tags. That is double the limit it is capped at.

I understand outfitters are making a living, but they are really hurting the elk population, too. Take grizzlies off of the list, and let outfitters make a living from clients coming to pay to hunt wolves and grizzlies.

#### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Friday, October 14, 2022 4:44:02 PM
Last Modified:	Friday, October 14, 2022 4:44:37 PM
Time Spent:	00:00:34
IP Address:	72.250.159.99

#### Page 1

# Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Daniel Kinka on behalf of American Prairie
City/Town	Malta
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	daniel@americanprairie.org

## Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

American Prairie very much support the restoration of elk (and other wildlife) populations to historic and biologically relevant abundance (at least throughout the greater Charles M. Russel National Wildlife Refuge ecosystem). However, as with recommendation #3, the more specific bullets in this recommendation seem wholly focused on the Northwest portion of the state (FWP Region 1). Further, most of the bullets in the description section of this proposal are unscientific and overly critical and unfair to FWP staff and biologists (cf., the internal assessment of this proposal by FWP's Wildlife Division).

### COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Friday, October 14, 2022 4:51:43 PM
Last Modified:	Friday, October 14, 2022 4:57:51 PM
Time Spent:	00:06:07
IP Address:	69.144.79.73

#### Page 1

# Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	jeff hjelt
City/Town	MISSOULA
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	jhjelt@hotmail.com

## Q2

#### Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

Wow, that committee "Recommendation" reads like a SSS bumper sticker. Hard to believe 20 years of wolf "restoration" has decimated NW Montana's elk herds when there's 120 years of fire suppression, fence building, and road building. Maybe we should improve habitat. Open closed roads in the winter so trappers can drive them? Um, they're closed for a reason, correct? I feel the Wildlife Division answered a lot of these questions with their own analysis. They're the ones who probably studied a little harder than the committee on the issues.

# COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Friday, October 14, 2022 4:56:20 PM
Last Modified:	Friday, October 14, 2022 4:59:14 PM
Time Spent:	00:02:53
IP Address:	98.125.198.155

# Page 1

## **Q1**

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Whitney shanks
City/Town	Kalispell
State/Province	MT

# Q2

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

I'm for managing elk where they are not. We need to start management of elk in smaller areas! Not bigger area's! Cut down on people during rifle season, put all elk in region one on permit

### COMPLETE

Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Friday, October 14, 2022 4:59:01 PM
Friday, October 14, 2022 4:59:52 PM
00:00:50
63.153.24.209

## Page 1

# Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Jason O'Rear
City/Town	Laurel
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	oreaz4789@q.com

### **Q2**

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

While i do support the transplanting of elk from over objective elk to the northwest, i believe the habitat should be restored and the animals need to come from a disease free district and herd.

I also think in area's like this the leases should be shortened, and smaller head counts to keep the habitat there if elk are transplanted

# COMPLETE

Collector:	Web Link 1 (Web Link)
Started:	Friday, October 14, 2022 6:37:19 PM
Last Modified:	Friday, October 14, 2022 6:39:11 PM
Time Spent:	00:01:51
IP Address:	98.125.252.79
Time Spent:	00:01:51

# Page 1

### Q1

Contact info (optional)	
Name	Donnie C Meek
City/Town	Bigfork
State/Province	МТ
Email Address	dmcats@centurylink.net

# **Q2**

Please provide comment on the recommendation for We Have to Manage Elk Where They Are Not.

There are so many elk here in Montana, hunters just need to know where they are. We need wolves to keep the diseases down that elk, deer, buffalo, cattle, etc. get... Wolves play a very important part in the ecosystem.